



Measuring the Sustainability of Tourism

Issues in measuring the employment aspects of sustainable tourism

Discussion Note by Igor Chernyshev¹
October 2018

1. Key policy issues in relation to the employment aspects of sustainable tourism

Tourism is one of the driving forces of global economic growth worldwide. By giving access to decent work opportunities in the tourism sector, society - particularly youth and women - can access and benefit from increased professional development and skills.

Tourism can contribute to achieving the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and its Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), but it should encourage a change in policies, business practices and consumer behavior to promote a more sustainable tourism sector.

At the same time, tourism can only flourish if the industry can employ qualified staff or sustainable workforce, which is the heart for excellent and prompt service delivery system.

Concurrently, in order to have the effective work force in the tourism sector much should be devoted to building democratic, participative management cultures; emphasis should be made on human resource management to bring quality, recognising employees as assets, rewarding staffs with best performance; linkage should be strengthen with educational institutions, etc. In other words, to be sustainable, the tourism sector should promote decent, socially responsible and quality employment.

¹ Mr Igor Chernyshev is Vice-President of the Green Jobs and Sustainable Development International Centre (GJASD International).

2. Potential perspectives and approaches to consideration of employment and sustainable tourism

2.1. Green jobs

The discussion presented in this Section does not propose any simple solution(s) but rather suggests an approach to measuring green jobs in the tourism industries as a supplementary indicator/measure of tourism sustainability.

2.1.1. Background

On 24 September 2008, Mr Juan Somavia (at the time ILO Director-General), Mr Achim Steiner (at the time UNEP Executive Director), Mr Guy Ryder (at the time General Secretary of the International Trade Union Confederation and the current ILO Director-General) and Ms Ronnie Goldberg (Vice-President of the International Organisation of Employers), presented jointly the report entitled "Green Jobs: Towards decent work in a sustainable, low-carbon world" at a press conference in New York at the United Nations.²

The joint report defined "a green job" as any decent job that contributes to preserving or restoring the quality of the environment, be it in agriculture, industry, services or administration. In practice these jobs: (i) reduce consumption of energy and raw materials; (ii) limit greenhouse gas emissions; (iii) minimize waste and pollution; (iv) protect and restore ecosystems; and (v) enable enterprises and communities to adapt to climate change³.

Presently, 1.2 billion jobs depend on a stable and healthy environment. Jobs industries like agriculture, fisheries and forestry, but also **tourism**, pharmaceuticals and others depend on natural environmental processes.⁴

Sustainable tourism takes full account of its current and future economic, social and environmental impacts, addressing the needs of host communities, visitors, the environment and the industry. It should generate local prosperity, decent work, promote environmental awareness, conserve and protect the environment, respect wildlife, flora, biodiversity, ecosystems and cultural diversity, and improve the welfare and livelihoods of local communities, including those of women, by supporting their local economies and the human and natural environment as a whole.

As has already been mentioned, sustainable tourism is directly and positively linked to the SDGs, poverty reduction, rural development, preservation of culture and society, gender equity, environmental protection and climate change mitigation.

² http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/newsroom/statements-and-speeches/WCMS_098519/lang--en/index.htm

³ ILO. *Sustainable development, decent work and green jobs*. Report V. International Labour Conference. 102nd Session, 2013. Geneva 2013. Available at: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed_norm/@relconf/documents/meetingdocument/wcms_207370.pdf

⁴ ILO. *Greening with Jobs*. World Employment and Social Outlook 2018; see available at: https://www.ilo.org/weso-greening/documents/WESO_Greening_EN_web2.pdf

The host community or grassroots perspective is a high profile focus of sustainable tourism discussion. A common area of interest is whether a host community is heavily impacted (i.e. in terms of quality of life) due to the extent of tourism activity. Improving life quality of local populations at communal level is considered as a solution to protect natural environment and local bio-diversity. In many cases, the rural population live in self-built houses lacking basic facilities, tools, access to financial resources and sustainable infrastructure. In order to improve the quality of life of local people, it is essential providing them with assistance in reconstruction of their habitat in order to make these areas attractive for eco-tourism and agro-tourism.

For successful and sustainable development of tourism at the local level in settlements adjacent to or located directly in the territory of national parks, plantations, protected forests and riverbanks, it is necessary to encourage the local population to take care of natural resources and biodiversity. A practical way to achieve this goal is the greening of tourism and creation of green jobs for the ingenious population. Thus, the ratio of green jobs can serve as an indicator of tourism suitability at the local and national levels.

2.1.2. Measurement issue⁵

In 2013, the 19th ICLS endorsed guidelines concerning a statistical definition of employment in the environmental sector and green jobs, which provide definitions of the main concepts, measurement methods and potential sources of data⁶. Given the fact that the definitions and measurement both of employment in the environmental sector and of green jobs were still in an experimental phase, the Conference requested that the ILO continue to develop data collection tools, test the tools and accumulate country experiences based on the guidelines, and research methodologies for estimating employment in the environmental sector and green jobs.

In line with the above, the following has been accomplished since the 19th ICLS:

- (a) The ILO has advanced in the development of new instruments for collecting information on employment in the environmental sector and materials to support the implementation of the guidelines. Two modules on employment in the production of environmental outputs and in environmental processes have been developed, for inclusion in the regular labour force survey and establishment survey. Instructions for completing the form as well as tabulation plans have also been developed.
- (b) Progress has been made on the testing of the relevance and suitability of the conceptual framework of the guidelines and the methodology developed for collecting data on employment in the environmental sector. Pilot studies were conducted in Albania (in 2013) and Mongolia (in 2014) and a survey was carried out in Mongolia (in 2016) on the measurement of employment in the environmental sector and green jobs. A comprehensive report presenting the results of both of the green jobs surveys

⁵ Partially adapted from: ILO Department of Statistics. *Report I: General report*. Twentieth International Conference of Labour Statisticians (Geneva, 10–19 October 2018). ICLS/20/2018/1, pp. 23-24; available at: https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---stat/documents/publication/wcms_644595.pdf

⁶ ILO. *Guidelines concerning a statistical definition of employment in the environmental sector*; available at: https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---stat/documents/normativeinstrument/wcms_230736.pdf

in Mongolia was published in 2017⁷. The report includes statistics on both the quantity and quality of jobs in the environmental sector. A number of other countries, including Barbados, Nigeria, the Philippines and Senegal, have expressed interest in testing and implementing the ILO guidelines on measuring employment in the environmental sector and green jobs.

- (c) The third conference of the Green Jobs Assessment Institutions Network (GAIN) in 2017 saw the launch of a training guidebook to support countries in assessing the labour market impacts of transitions to greener economies and the related structural changes and in implementing the Paris Agreement on climate change⁸. It includes four learning modules: Module 1 describes what green employment projection models are and how they will help with designing and refining policies. Module 2 provides guidance on the concepts and statistical definitions concerning the green economy and green jobs as well as practical steps in generating statistics on employment in the environmental sector and green jobs from various sources. Module 3 explains how to expand conventional input–output tables to feature green industries and jobs, and how to build a static comparative employment projection model. Module 4 provides guidance on assessing income distribution effects using supply and use tables and social accounting matrices. The main intended audience of the training guidebook is policymakers, statisticians, analysts and researchers in ministries, national statistics offices, employers' and workers' organisations, research institutions and universities, and international organisations.

2.1.3. Green jobs in tourism industries

A number of similarities between the measurement of employment in production of environmental outputs and employment in the tourism industries can be identified.

Employment in production of environmental outputs

Employment in the production of environmental outputs is not equal to total employment in the establishments producing environmental goods and services to be consumed outside the producing unit. Many producers of environmental goods and services also produce a range of other goods and services. For example, producer of solar panels may also produce some products that have no environmental purpose and employment in the production of environmental goods and services may therefore be only a relatively small component of their total employment. Consequently, employment in the production of environmental outputs can be measured directly only in specialist environmental establishments whose output is 100 per cent environmental. In establishments where the production of environmental goods and services constitutes only a secondary activity of an establishment (non-specialist producers) or where, if it is a principal activity, it is combined with secondary activities in the same establishment, employment cannot be measured directly unless the jobs are linked to the type of products produced. Linkage of this kind would be costly and difficult to implement in data collection.

⁷ NSO, PAGE, ILO. *Employment in the Environmental Sector and Green Jobs in Mongolia*. Ulaanbaatar 2017; available at: https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/green-jobs/publications/WCMS_612880/lang-en/index.htm

⁸ GAIN Training Guidebook "*How to measure and model social and employment outcomes of climate and sustainable development policies*"; available at: http://www.un-page.org/files/public/green_jobs_training_guidebook_0.pdf

Employment in the tourism industries

In each country, the tourism industries will include all establishments whose main activity is a tourism-characteristic activity⁹. These tourism industries are common to all countries except for the individual country-specific tourism characteristic activities. It should be noted that persons engaged in tourism-characteristic activities of an establishment belonging to a non-tourism industries (e.g., all establishments whose principal activity is not a tourism-characteristic activity) will not be included in “employment in the tourism industries”. On the other hand, persons employed in an establishment belonging to a tourism industry who participate in the establishment’s non-tourism-characteristic activities will be included in “employment in the tourism industries”.¹⁰

Employment in production of environmental outputs

The main reason why employment in production of environmental outputs cannot be measured directly is the absence of information on employment associated with the production at the product code level. Where direct estimates of employment in the production of environmental goods and services cannot be obtained, it can nevertheless be approximated using the information on the share of output (sales) of environmental goods and services in total output (sales). It is necessary first to calculate the value of environmental goods and services produced as a proportion of the value of the total production of the establishment. The same proportion can then be applied to total employment in the establishment in order to estimate employment in production of environmental outputs. Thus, if 100 per cent of an establishment’s outputs are environmental goods and services, then 100 per cent of employment in the establishment is included. If 50 per cent of the output is environmental, 50 per cent of employment is included.

Employment in the tourism industries

It should be noted that the total output of a “Tourism Characteristic Industry” (TCI) usually exceeds consumption by visitors, as some of the outputs of most TCIs is purchased by non-visitors. Even for a commodity such as meals in restaurants, visitors’ purchases will usually account for a portion of the total number of meals produced. Concurrently, the total employment of a tourism characteristic industry does not necessarily equate to the employment generated by tourism demand. In the above example, output of food services will involve substantial sales to non-visitors. It would be inappropriate to allocate all employment in food services - therefore, it is necessary to use an allocator to approximate more closely the levels of employment generated by tourism sector. This is dealt by the use of the tourism ratio or the tourism value added industry ratio¹¹. This

⁹ United Nations and UNWTO. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. *International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008*. Studies in Methods, Series M No. 83/Rev.1. New York 2010, paras. 6.15. to 6.20.; available at: https://unstats.un.org/unsd/publication/Seriesm/SeriesM_83rev1e.pdf2008

¹⁰ United Nations and UNWTO. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. *International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008*. Studies in Methods, Series M No. 83/Rev.1. New York 2010, para. 7.4.; available at: https://unstats.un.org/unsd/publication/Seriesm/SeriesM_83rev1e.pdf

¹¹ For the main tourism characteristic industries it is possible to identify the tourism share of the production of the main product (around 100%) or other characteristic products (for instance, food and beverage serving services are around 100% tourism related in hotels but not so much in restaurants; accommodation services are around 100% in hotels and hotels produce around 100% of this product in the economy). *Tourism Satellite Accounts in the European Union* - Vol. 3, p. 54.

method of using the tourism value added industry ratios involves an assumption that the employment generated by tourism in each industry is in direct proportion to value added generated by tourism in the benchmark year¹².

It should also be observed that the impact of tourism industries on employment is brought in the following ways¹³:

- i. Direct employment in the tourism industries.¹⁴
- ii. Indirect employment in the sectors supplying inputs to the tourism industries.¹⁵
- iii. Induced effect on employment as a result of subsequent rounds of spending.

2.1.4. Employment in environmental processes and green tourism employment

The measurement of employment in the environmental activities must take account of employment from an output perspective (type of goods and services produced for consumption outside the producing unit) as well as from a process perspective (type of goods and services produced for consumption within the producing unit). The concept and measurement of employment in the production of environmental outputs is linked to certain establishment-related characteristics, while the concept of employment in environmental processes is linked to job-related characteristics such as occupation, skills and tasks, etc.

The second component discussed above, namely employment in environmental processes, requires the collection of data concerning job-related characteristics such as occupation, the specific tasks and duties undertaken in the jobs and the kind of processes or technologies used.

As these employment characteristics largely apply to job-related characteristics of persons employed in the tourism industries (activities), it is proposed to use the same approach to measuring green tourism employment.

The fact is that occupation on its own is not sufficient to accommodate the requirements of measuring employment in environmental processes: while a small number of workers employed in occupations such as environmental engineering or refuse sorting may be easily identified because their occupation is entirely environmental, the majority have occupations that involve both environmental and non-environmental activities. Some tasks and duties are divided in such a way that they are undertaken with environmental processes and technologies while the rest of the work involves non-environmental

¹² Unite Nations. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. *International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008 Compilation Guide*. Studies in Methods, Series M No.94, New York 2016, p. 18; available at: <https://unstats.un.org/unsd/tradeserv/tourism/E-IRTS-Comp-Guide%202008%20For%20Web.pdf>

¹³ Unite Nations. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. *International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008 Compilation Guide*. Studies in Methods, Series M No.94, New York 2016, p. 22-23; available at: <https://unstats.un.org/unsd/tradeserv/tourism/E-IRTS-Comp-Guide%202008%20For%20Web.pdf>

¹⁴ Tourism employment can be categorized at two separate levels depending on their involvement in or contribution to tourism supply-side. Front offices in hotels, restaurants, travel agencies, tourism information offices, aircrafts, cruise lines, resorts or shopping outlets provide direct employment because their employees are in contact with tourists and cater for tourist demand.

¹⁵ Tourism also supports indirect employment in activities like restaurant suppliers, construction companies that build and maintain tourist facilities as well as necessary infrastructure, aircraft manufacturers, various handicrafts producers, marketing agencies, accounting services, which are more or less dependent on the companies providing direct employment for their revenues.

processes and technologies. For example, a planning engineer may spend part of his/her time on work associated with installing recycling equipment in the establishment and part on obtaining permission for commercial premises with no distinguishing environmental characteristics.

An additional problem is that many workers are involved in the production of environmental goods and services for consumption both within and outside the establishment. In order to measure only the part that is related to production of environmental goods and services for consumption within the establishment, it is necessary to split the hours spent on each component in order to estimate the number of full-time jobs. An alternative would be to measure employment in environmental processes regardless of intended consumption. A third option is to split the volume of employment, if possible, in proportion to the value of internal and external consumption.

Similar situations are observed within employment in the tourism industries.

The 19th ICLS proposed to make a distinction between workers that spend less than 50 per cent and those that spend more than 50 per cent of their time on environmental processes. It should be recalled in this regard that the IRTS 2008 recommend that the average hours of full-time workers economy wide be used as the basis for determining the full-time equivalents of part-time jobs.¹⁶

Likewise employment in environmental processes, green employment in the tourism industries is more difficult to measure and this will involve asking questions that are not routinely included in economic censuses and surveys aimed at measuring production. Establishments can, for example, be asked to provide information on the number of workers employed in activities leading to the production of environmentally-friendly goods and services for tourism consumption within a tourism establishment. Because of the potential increase in respondent burden, information on this component is likely to be collected less frequently than information on total employment in the production of tourism goods and services.

2.1.5. Green jobs in the tourism industries: SEEA and EGSS

The UN Statistical Commission's System of Environmental-Economic Accounting 2012 Central Framework (SEEA)¹⁷ is a statistical framework consisting of a comprehensive set of tables and accounts, which guides the compilation of consistent and comparable statistics and indicators for policymaking, analysis and research.

The EUROSTAT Environmental Goods and Services Sector: A Data Collection Handbook (EGSS)¹⁸ provides guidance on how to collect, interpret and present data on the environmental goods and services sector. It has been elaborated because there is a need to produce and compile comparable statistics on the environmental sector in order to respond to current policy interests and to help implement future policy measures

¹⁶ United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, *International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008 Compilation Guide*, Studies in Methods, Series M No.94, New York 2016, p 181.

¹⁷ Available at: https://unstats.un.org/unsd/envaccounting/seearev/seea_cf_final_en.pdf

¹⁸ Available at: <http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/documents/3859598/5910217/KS-RA-09-012-EN.PDF>

directed at the environmental sector. The aim of the standard tables included in the handbook is essentially to separately identify employment, turnover, value added and exports according to different sectors and activities in the environmental sector.

Although tourism activities are not considered to be activities taking place in the environmental sector *per se*, as we have seen in the earlier discussion, green employment and green jobs can be directly or indirectly linked with such activities. Therefore, the recommendations contained in the two publications are of direct relevance to the developmental work on measuring green jobs for sustainable tourism. Given that, the glossaries of environmental terms and environmental terminology may be particularly useful to identify “green” tourism activities and occupations.

For example, among the economic activities whose primary purpose is to reduce or eliminate pressures on the environment or to make more efficient use of natural resources shown in Sub-section 3.2.5, there are activities that can be attributed to green jobs in the tourism industries (see highlighted activities).

In addition, if we compare the suggested list of connected activities presented in Table 1 with ecosystem services as defined in SEEA¹⁹, it becomes quite evident that jobs in “ecotourism” would largely meet the criteria set for such activities.

Table 1: Characteristics of the different types of green activities

Type	Purpose of protecting the environment	Examples
Core activities	Primary purpose	Environnemental protection: air pollution control, protection of biodiversity, waste management Resource management: water management, renewable energy, recycling
Connected activities	Secondary purpose	Hybrid cars, green building, green ICT, organic farming, sustainable tourism , sustainable forestry
Dependent Activities	No environmental purpose but dependent on environmental quality	Agriculture, commercial forestry, tourism
Other green activities	No environmental purpose	Public transport services, ICT

In this regard, it is important to note that the greening of the economy is a continuing process, and more activities from tourism industries are expected to move into the category of green jobs.

¹⁹ Ecosystem services are the contributions of ecosystems to benefits used in economic and other human activity. Ecosystem services, which are supplied in many ways and vary from ecosystem to ecosystem, may be divided into three groups: (a) provisioning services (such as the provision of timber from forests); (b) regulating services (provided, for example, by forests when they act as a sink for carbon); and (c) cultural services (such as the enjoyment provided to visitors to a national park). Generally, provisioning services are related to the material benefits of environmental assets, whereas the other types of ecosystem services are related to the non-material benefits of environmental assets; SEEA, para. 2.22.

2.1.6. Data collection sources and methods

Data collection is an integral and essential part of developing and updating statistics on green jobs in the tourism industries. Formal data collection activities should be established, adapted to countries' national circumstances and reviewed periodically. In most cases the capacity and willingness of agencies to conduct new surveys will be limited by the resources available and the priorities given to policy needs for various statistics.

The main sources of information that may be used to assess how many green jobs exist in tourism industries (activities) are censuses, labour force and establishment surveys, administrative records (although the latter may not be sufficiently efficient in this particular case). To optimise the resource used, it is suggested that, as far as possible, the required data be collected by extending existing surveys rather than by initiating totally new ones. The possibility of incorporating new questions or modules in existing, on-going or planned surveys should be explored in order to fill the data gaps.

For example, the NSO of Mongolia conducted the survey on employment of environmental sector and green jobs by attaching questionnaire modules with a set of questions to the fourth quarter of the 2014 regular Labour Force Survey and used its regular Enterprise Survey conducted in the first and second quarter of 2016²⁰.

Depending on national priorities, data collection could be focused on key tourism activities (industries) (e.g., the largest in terms of their contribution to the provision of environmentally-friendly goods and services) and/or on those that have the greatest potential to change. A pragmatic approach could be to focus on some resource management subsectors (green tourism, agro-tourism, ecotourism, green resorts and green or eco-hotels, national parks, sports and recreation facilities, environmentally-friendly transport and catering, etc.) where clear benchmarks exist (e.g., specific labels).

Respondent burden may be minimised by the inclusion in questionnaires of filtering questions that identify possible in-scope respondents, so that only those establishments that indicate they provide at least one of the selected environmentally-friendly goods or services would be asked detailed questions on tourism characteristic green job activities.

In order to estimate green employment in the production of environmentally-friendly tourism output, the questionnaire should include, as a minimum, questions on the type of goods and services produced in the establishments surveyed, the value of or sales revenues from these goods and services and the number of persons employed in the establishment.

Information that would allow estimation of employment by each type of environmentally-friendly tourism-characteristic output could be obtained by asking respondents in establishments to indicate whether the production of environmentally-friendly goods or services is their principal or secondary activity, and to provide a list of these goods and services indicating the percentage of total value associated with each environmental good or service. Respondents could be assisted in identifying these goods and services

²⁰ NSO, PAGE, ILO. *Employment in the Environmental Sector and Green Jobs in Mongolia*. Ulaanbaatar 2017, p. 9; available at: https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/green-jobs/publications/WCMS_612880/lang-en/index.htm

Data collected in this way will include volume/value by type of green/environmental outputs (goods and services). For establishments that report that their products are entirely environmentally-friendly, 100 per cent of employment in the establishment will be counted as employment in green employment (e.g., organisation and support of wwoofing²¹). For establishments that undertake both environmentally-friendly and non-environmentally friendly activities, it will be possible to isolate the former, thereby facilitating allocation of an appropriate proportion of total employment in the establishment to the green employment (green jobs).

2.1.7. Characteristic tourism occupations and green jobs

True, there is the (urgent) need for additional consistent international concepts and measurement standards. In fact, these issues has been raised at various levels and numerous international fora. Unfortunately, due to both objective and subjective reasons, this issue of key importance for tourism statistics has not been dealt with.

However, the above does not mean that countries do not classify tourism workforce by occupation. It is proposed therefore to use the MST WG for launching/reviving a discussion on how to tackle this issue.

In the meantime and by way of illustration, an example of green occupations (green jobs) in ecotourism is presented in Box 1 below.

Box 2: Occupations in ecotourism (an example)

Development and management: Tourism development specialist, sustainable tourism business development manager, sustainable development consultancy, ecosystem management and development, ecosystem management and development officer, tourism and human resources advisor.

Operating ecotourism locations: Heritage tourism officer, sustainable tourism manager, ecotourism project manager, rainforest station manager, ecolodge manager, cultural tourism project facilities manager, rural tourism officer, sustainable tourism operator, ecotour leaders, green caretakers of tropical island, coastal tourism and conservation program officer, sustainable consumption and conservation manager, conservation expedition country coordinator.

Managing natural lands: Nature tourism ranger, nature tourism park manager, parks and recreation director, wildlife visitor centre advisor, reserve director, conservation program manager, conservation project manager, preserve manager, naturalist programmer, conservation expeditions field positions, conservation program assistant.

Scientific roles: Conservation scientist, nature centre research technician, biodiversity specialist, wildlife research assistant.

Promoting ecotourism: Guidebook writers, protected areas communications officer, responsible tourism communications manager, adventure travel promotion manager, responsible tourism marketing manager.

Source: L. McClelland, Carol. *Green Jobs in Ecotourism*; available at:
<http://www.dummies.com/careers/career-planning/choosing-a-career/green-jobs-in-ecotourism/>

²¹ "Working Weekends on Organic Farms".

2.1.8. A “Job” in a tourism industry

It seems that there is no internationally approved definition of “a job in a tourism industry”. However, this issue could be temporarily resolved using the definition suggested in Box VII.10 of the IRTS-2008 Compilation Guide²² (see Box 3 below).

In parallel, like the ILO at the time of ISCO-88 updating²³, the UNWTO may use the opportunity of the MST Working Group platform and organise a global consultation on the above definition. Also, like in the case of ISCO-88 updating, the definition could be approved by the UNWTO Committee on Statistics and Tourism Satellite Account and thereafter presented to the UN Statistical Commission for its endorsement.²⁴

Box 3. International Standard Classification of Occupations: “job”

In the context of ISCO-08 **a job is defined** as a set of tasks and duties performed, or meant to be performed, by one person, including for an employer or in self-employment*.

Through the application of this definition a job in a tourism industry could be defined as a set of tasks and duties performed, or meant to be performed, by one person in an establishment that carries out a tourism characteristic activity as its principal activity.

* Source: International Labour Office *International Standard Classification of Occupations: Structure, group definitions and correspondence tables (ISCO-2008)*, Box VII.10, p. 11, para.41; available at: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---dcomm/---publ/documents/publication/wcms_172572.pdf

A small “on-line sub-group” could be created within the MST Working Group that could work through a web platform. The work of such sub-group or a Task Force could begin by reviewing the Room Document of the 19th ICLS “Proposal for Identifying Characteristic Occupations of the Tourism Industries as a Tourism Thematic View within ISCO-08 and National Occupational Classification Systems”²⁵, which is largely based on the Canadian experience, and develop it further.

2.1.9. Brief summary remarks

To summarise the discussion presented in this Section, the MST Expert Group may wish to consider the following approach to measuring green jobs in the tourism industries.

- i. It is proposed to begin with the identification of tourism characteristic activities linked with the environmental processes and thereafter identify those activities that could be considered in terms of green jobs.

²² United Nations. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. *International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008 Compilation Guide*. Studies in Methods, Series M No.94, New York 2016, p. 183; available at: <https://unstats.un.org/unsd/tradeserv/tourism/E-IRTS-Comp-Guide%202008%20For%20Web.pdf>

²³ The ILO set up Technical Expert Group on updating ISCO-88; consultations were carried out through meetings and an electronic discussion.

²⁴ Given the urgency and need for the updated ISCO for the 2005-2014 Population Census round, ISCO-08 was exceptionally adopted as a resolution of a Meeting of Experts on Labour Statistics in December 2007. This meeting was convened by the Governing Body of the ILO in response to a request made by the 17th International Conference of Labour Statisticians in 2003. It was subsequently endorsed by the Governing Body of the ILO in March 2008.

²⁵ International Labour Office. Issue: *Proposal for Identifying Characteristic Occupations of the Tourism Industries as a Tourism Thematic View within ISCO-08 and National Occupational Classification Systems*. Room Document 13, 19th International Conference of Labour Statisticians, Geneva, 2-11 October 2013; available at: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---stat/documents/meetingdocument/wcms_222947.pdf

- ii. It will be easier to begin the work at local (grassroots) or sub-regional levels. Some ideas on how to proceed could be found in Chapter 6. Measuring tourism and sustainable development at subnational levels: setting a focus of the *Tourism, Territory and Sustainability: a statistical insight at subnational levels (Towards a set of UNWTO Guidelines)*.
- iii. The methodology proposed in the ILO learning modules described in 2.1.1 (c) above should be studied and adapted to the MST work.
- iv. Green jobs should be express in numbers and hours worked (during a specific period).
- v. The MST Expert Group may consider testing the approach proposed in countries that already measure and publish green jobs estimates in their national economies and who have considerably advanced in producing TSA Table 7.

2.2. Decent work

2.2.1. Introduction

Decent work sums up the aspirations of people in their working lives. It involves opportunities for work that is productive and delivers a fair income, security in the workplace and social protection for families, better prospects for personal development and social integration, freedom for people to express their concerns, organize and participate in the decisions that affect their lives and equality of opportunity and treatment for all women and men.²⁶

It can hardly be disputed that an appropriate balance between economic and social development is required as a basis for sustained economic growth. Since the difficulty lies in suggesting where this appropriate balance lies for any given country and what are the options available to achieve and sustain it within a given set of constraints, empirical analysis is indispensable to aid policy making.

During the UN General Assembly in September 2015, decent work and the four pillars of the Decent Work Agenda – employment creation, social protection, rights at work, and social dialogue – became integral elements of the new 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.

The ILO Framework on the Measurement of Decent Work covers the following ten substantive elements: employment opportunities; adequate earnings and productive work; decent working time; combining work, family and personal life; work that should be abolished; stability and security at work; equal opportunity and treatment in employment; safe work environment; social security; and social dialogue.

In 2009, the ILO initiated the *Green Jobs Global Programme* to promote opportunity, equity and a just transition to a low-carbon, climate resilient and environmentally friendly economy. The programme encourages governments, employers and workers to

²⁶ Adapted from <http://www.ilo.org/global/topics/decent-work/lang--en/index.htm>

collaborate on generating coherent policies and effective programmes that will support a green economy with green jobs and decent work for all.

In the broader definition currently used by the *Green Jobs Programme of the ILO*: “Jobs are green when they help reduce negative environmental impact ultimately leading to environmentally, economically and socially sustainable enterprises and economies. More precisely green jobs are decent jobs that: reduce consumption of energy and raw materials; limit greenhouse gas emissions; minimize waste and pollution; and protect and restore ecosystems”²⁷.

2.2.2. Measurement issues

Stemming from the discussion and suggestions presented in Section 2.1, it is proposed that the MST Expert Groups considers a minimalistic approach to measuring decent green jobs.

More specifically, as the first step, it is proposed to assume that a green job in the tourism industry is considered to be a decent job, if (a) it is formal (i.e., the enterprise is officially registered and the person who holds the job enjoys the statutory right for annual leave, sick leave and is covered by social security/protection by the employer); and (b) the usual hours worked by a given person on this job do not exceed the statutory duration of working time set up for the particular type of work performed on this job.

Consequently, the proposed approach to decent green jobs has nothing to do with " a synthetic multi-dimensional conceptual construction (see 10 dimensions above) nor with a unitary basic statistical aggregate of "green jobs", as somebody might have understood reading Sub-section 2.2.1.

3. Key challenges in measuring employment in the context of sustainable tourism

Both concepts of “green jobs” and “decent green jobs” are new for their application in the framework of the tourism industries.

This requires their adaptation and testing.

4. Summary of available measurement frameworks, statistical standards, other references on employment themes

ILO. *Guidelines concerning a statistical definition of employment in the environmental sector*

(https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---stat/documents/normativeinstrument/wcms_230736.pdf).

²⁷ See: *The Green Jobs Programme of the ILO*; available at: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---emp_ent/documents/publication/wcms_371396.pdf

ILO. *Decent Work Indicators Guidelines for Producers and Users of Statistical and Legal Framework Indicators: ILO Manual. Second Version* (http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---stat/documents/publication/wcms_223121.pdf).

GAIN Training Guidebook “*How to measure and model social and employment outcomes of climate and sustainable development policies*” (http://www.un-page.org/files/public/green_jobs_training_guidebook_0.pdf).

United Nations. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. *International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008 Compilation Guide* (<https://unstats.un.org/unsd/tradeserv/tourism/E-IRTS-Comp-Guide%202008%20For%20Web.pdf>).

Conclusion

The MST Expert Group should be ambitious, realistic and pragmatic: (a) green jobs already exist and their number is growing inside and outside the environmental sector and in the tourism sector, in particular; (b) if green jobs are measured elsewhere, they can be measured and used as a supplementary or auxiliary measure of sustainable tourism.

As they say, “Where there’s a will, there’s a way”..!

Bibliography

European foundation for the improvement of living and working conditions. *Employment and Disability: Back to Work Strategies. EU Hotel and Restaurant Sector*. Dublin 2005; available at: <https://digitalcommons.ilr.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?referer=https://www.google.ch/&httpsredir=1&article=1162&context=gladnetcollect>

EUROSTAT. *Tourism Satellite Accounts in the European Union - Vol. 3; 2009 edition*; available at: <https://publications.europa.eu/en/publication-detail/-/publication/15056e6c-4505-4967-8e12-95a1e82a2d17/language-en>

EUROSTAT Environmental Goods and Services Sector: A Data Collection Handbook (EGSS); available at: <http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/documents/3859598/5910217/KS-RA-09-012-EN.PDF>

International Labour Organization. *Green Jobs: Towards decent work in a sustainable, low-carbon world*. Geneva 2008; available at: http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/newsroom/statements-and-speeches/WCMS_098519/lang--en/index.htm

. ____ *Proposal for Identifying Characteristic Occupations of the Tourism Industries as a Tourism Thematic View within ISCO-08 and National Occupational Classification*

- Systems*. Room Document 13, 19th International Conference of Labour Statisticians, Geneva, 2-11 October 2013; available at: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---stat/documents/meetingdocument/wcms_222947.pdf
- . ____ *Sustainable development, decent work and green jobs*. Report V. International Labour Conference. 102nd Session, 2013. Geneva 2013. Available at: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed_norm/@relconf/documents/meetingdocument/wcms_207370.pdf
 - . ____ *Greening with Jobs*. World Employment and Social Outlook 2018; see available at: https://www.ilo.org/weso-greening/documents/WESO_Greening_EN_web2.pdf
 - . ____ *Guidelines concerning a statistical definition of employment in the environmental sector*; Geneva 2017; available at: https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---stat/documents/normativeinstrument/wcms_230736.pdf
 - . ____ *The Green Jobs Programme of the ILO*; available at: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---emp_ent/documents/publication/wcms_371396.pdf
 - . ____ ILO Department of Statistics. *Report I: General report*. Twentieth International Conference of Labour Statisticians (Geneva, 10–19 October 2018). ICLS/20/2018/1; available at: https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---stat/documents/publication/wcms_644595.pdf
- GAIN Training Guidebook “*How to measure and model social and employment outcomes of climate and sustainable development policies*”; available at: http://www.un-page.org/files/public/green_jobs_training_guidebook_0.pdf
- NSO, PAGE, ILO. *Employment in the Environmental Sector and Green Jobs in Mongolia*. Ulaanbaatar 2017; available at: https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/green-jobs/publications/WCMS_612880/lang--en/index.htm
- United Nations and UNWTO. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. *International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008*. Studies in Methods, Series M No. 83/Rev.1. New York 2010; available at: https://unstats.un.org/unsd/publication/Seriesm/SeriesM_83rev1e.pdf2008
- United Nations. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. *International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008 Compilation Guide*. Studies in Methods, Series M No.94, New York 2016; available at: https://unstats.un.org/unsd/publication/seriesm/seriesm_83rev1e.pdf
- UN Statistical Commission's System of Environmental-Economic Accounting 2012 Central Framework (SEEA); available at: https://unstats.un.org/unsd/envaccounting/seearev/seea_cf_final_en.pdf

United Nations. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. *International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008 Compilation Guide*. Studies in Methods, Series M No.94, New York 2016, p. 18; available at:
<https://unstats.un.org/unsd/tradeserv/tourism/E-IRTS-Comp-Guide%202008%20For%20Web.pdf>

United Nations. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. *International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008 Compilation Guide*. Studies in Methods, Series M No.94, New York 2016, p. 183; available at:
<https://unstats.un.org/unsd/tradeserv/tourism/E-IRTS-Comp-Guide%202008%20For%20Web.pdf>