



2017
INTERNATIONAL YEAR
OF SUSTAINABLE TOURISM
FOR DEVELOPMENT



UNWTO Commission for the Middle East

Forty-second meeting

Dubai, United Arab Emirates, 24 April 2017 (10:00- 13:00)

CME/42/5
Madrid, March 2017
Original: English

5. Report of the UNWTO Committees

- (a) Programme and Budget Committee
- (b) Committee on Tourism and Sustainability
- (c) Committee on Tourism and Competitiveness
- (d) Committee on Statistics and TSA

This document was prepared by the Secretariat to facilitate the necessary coordination between the Commission and its representatives on the various organs and subsidiary organs of the Organization. It reports on the mandate, composition and meetings held during the period 2016-2017 of the following UNWTO Committees:

- A. Programme and Budget Committee (PBC)
- B. Committee for Tourism and Sustainability (CTS)
- C. Committee on Tourism and Competitiveness (CTC)
- D. Committee on Statistics and Tourism Satellite Account (CTSA)

Reports on the meetings held by these Committees during the period under review are attached to this document as Annexes I, II, III and IV, respectively.

A. Programme and Budget Committee (PBC)

1. Function

The function of the Programme and Budget Committee is to be the main instrument of the Executive Council:

- (a) for the preparation of the Organization's budget and programme of work;
- (b) for the monitoring of the programme of work and its financial implementation; and
- (c) for the systematic evaluation and audit of its outputs, results and overall performance.

The Programme and Budget Committee:

- (a) examines, prior to their submission to the Council, all documents in relation with the budget and programme of work of the Organization, as prepared by the Secretary-General;
- (b) reports to the Council accordingly;
- (c) carries out any other tasks which may be entrusted to it by the Council.

2. Members and terms of office

Chairperson: **Argentina**

Vice-Chairman: **France**

- **Africa:** Angola* (2017), Cameroon ** (2019)
- **Americas:** Mexico* (2019), Argentina** (2019)
- **East Asia and the Pacific:** Japan* (2019), Malaysia** (2019)
- **Europe:** France* (2019), Hungary** (2019)
- **Middle East:** Saudi Arabia* (2019), Lebanon** (2019)
- **South Asia:** India* (2017), Maldives** (2019)
- **Associate Members:** Flanders
- **Affiliate Members:** Chairman of the Affiliate Members Board, Consolidated Tourism and Investment Consultants Limited (CTICO), Jamaica

Notes:

**PBC Members elected by the Executive Council have a mandate limited to their EC mandate*

*** PBC Members elected by the respective Regional Commission, until 2019*

3. Meetings

Last meeting (10th): Luxor, Egypt, October 2016

- The PBC notably discussed the survey on priorities for 2018-2019, launched at the end of 2016
- The Report on the results of the survey is now available

Next meeting (11th): Madrid, Spain, 10 May 2017:

- The PBC will notably review the ***Draft Programme of Work and Budget for 2018-2019***, taking into account the results of the survey
- **Saudi Arabia** and **Lebanon** are the Middle East's representatives in the PBC. Members can share with them any doubts and suggestions regarding any issue related to programme and budget

B. Committee on Tourism and Sustainability (CTS)

1. Function

The function of the Committee on Tourism and Sustainability, as a subsidiary Organ of the Executive Council, is to play an Advisory and consultative role

The work of the CTS aims at:

- Advancing sustainable and resilient tourism development
- Monitoring the implementation of the programme of work of Sustainable Development of Tourism
- Strengthening the normative role for the Secretariat's work in the area of SDT (Recommendations to the Executive Council and other bodies)

During the period in review, the CTS members:

- Contributed to the report prepared by the UNWTO Secretariat "Promotion of sustainable tourism, including ecotourism, for poverty eradication and environment protection" submitted to the UN General Assembly and adopted with resolution 71/240 of 27 January 2016
- Contributed to the new rules and structures guiding the Operation and Management of the UNWTO International Network of Sustainable Tourism Observatories (INSTO)
- Engaged on the work related to SCP guidelines and the global survey on SCP in tourism planning within the framework of 10 Year Framework of Programmes on Sustainable Consumption and Production - Sustainable Tourism Programme 10YFP STP
- Engaged on the preparations for the 2017 International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development

Terms of office: Four-year period

Working language: English

2. Members and terms of office (2015 – 2019)

Acting Chair: **Colombia**

- **Africa:** Morocco, Senegal
- **Americas:** Colombia, Honduras
- **East Asia and the Pacific:** China
- **Europe:** Lithuania, Montenegro
- **Middle East:** Oman
- **South Asia:** Bhutan
- **Representative of the Associate Members:** Puerto Rico
- **Representatives of the Affiliate Members:**
 - Consolidated Tourism and Investments Consultants Limited (CTICO), Jamaica
 - International Youth Hostel Federation (IYHF) Hostelling International, UK
- **Observers:** Brazil, Chile

3. Meetings

- Open Consultation Meeting, Advancing the Measurement of Sustainable Tourism Development with the participation of CTS representatives from Colombia, Lithuania, Montenegro and IYHF, Madrid, June 2016

- 7th CTS meeting, with the participation of representatives from China, Colombia and Morocco, IYHF and Chile as Observer, Teleconference, June 2016

- 8th CTS meeting which took place on the occasion of the Official Opening of the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development in the framework of FITUR used the format of a public meeting to show cast the consultative process and discussed both elements of strategic importance to sustainable development, planning and measurement. It counted with the participation of representatives from China, Colombia, Lithuania, Mexico, Morocco, Peru, IYHF and SEGITTUR (Spain), as members of the CTS and invited experts, FITUR, January 2017

C. Committee on Tourism and Competitiveness (CTC)

1. Function

The main function of the Committee on Tourism and Competitiveness is to:

- Support the Organization in fulfilling its normative role;
- Provide a dialogue mechanism between the public and the private stakeholders and the academia within a coherent framework to provide guidance in building and strengthening tourism competitiveness policies and strategies;
- Identify, harmonize and develop concepts, models and definitions as regards the key qualitative factors of tourism / destination competitiveness.

2. Members and terms of office (2015 – 2019)

Chair: **Peru**

Vice-Chair: **Italy**

- **Africa:** Gambia, Namibia
- **Americas:** Mexico, Peru
- **East Asia and the Pacific:** Republic of Korea
- **Europe:** Croatia, Italy
- **Middle East:** Qatar
- **South Asia:** Maldives
- **Representative of the Associate Members:** Aruba
- **Representative of the Affiliate Members:** Chairman of the Affiliate Members Board, Consolidated Tourism and Investment Consultants Limited (CTICO), Jamaica
- **Invited participants** (invited by the Secretary-General on an ad-hoc basis): AENOR - Spanish Association for Standardisation and Certification (new name UNE).

3. Meetings

3.1. Meeting held during the period 2013-2015

- First (presential) Meeting: 28 August, 2013, Victoria Falls, Zambia /Zimbabwe (General Assembly)
- First virtual Meeting: 27 march, 2014
- 2nd virtual Meeting: 03 July, 2014
- 3rd virtual Meeting: 22 September, 2014
- 2nd (presential) Meeting: 28 January, 2015, Madrid, Spain
- 3rd (presential) Meeting: September, 2015, Medellin, Colombia (General Assembly)

3.2. Meeting held during the period 2016-2017

- 4th (presential) Meeting: 22 January, 2016, Madrid, Spain
- 4th virtual Meeting: 21 April, 2016
- 5th (presential) Meeting: 20 January, 2017, Madrid, Spain
- 5th virtual Meeting: 2 March, 2017

3.3. Outputs and follow up

- During the mandate 2015-2017 the CTC members elaborated the following definitions/concepts which were endorsed by the 103th Executive Council:
 - ✓ Tourism destination
 - ✓ Destination management / marketing organization
 - ✓ Tourism product
 - ✓ Tourism value chain
 - ✓ Quality of a tourism destination
 - ✓ Innovation in tourism
 - ✓ Competitiveness of a tourism destination
- These definitions will be submitted to the 22nd Session of the General Assembly in Chengdu, China (4-9 September 2017) for approval.
- A simplified framework for destination competitiveness has been identified including an open-ended list of quantitative and qualitative factors under two topics: i) governance, management and market dynamics, ii) destination appeal, attractors, products and supply.
- Based on consensus, the CTC members shall decide on several lines of action for each of the factors, categorized as follows:
 - ✓ Draft an operational definition, or
 - ✓ Draft a position paper / technical report (to be published), or
 - ✓ Compile the information and data from the already existing available sources
- The CTC will identify, if needed, and suggest other quantitative and qualitative factors.
- The CTC also recommended to prioritize 10 tourism types with a view to start elaborating definitions which should be finalized by June 2017:
 - ✓ Cultural tourism
 - ✓ Ecotourism
 - ✓ Rural tourism
 - ✓ Adventure tourism
 - ✓ Health tourism
 - ✓ Business tourism (related to the Meetings Industry)
 - ✓ Gastronomy tourism
 - ✓ Marine/Coastal tourism
 - ✓ Urban tourism
 - ✓ Mountain tourism
- Additionally, upon the request of Gambia and Qatar respectively, “education tourism” and “sports tourism” will also be reviewed and incorporated in the list above.
- Once consensus is reached on part or all of the definitions, the proposal on the operational definitions shall be submitted to the 106th Executive Council and approval by the 22nd Session of the General Assembly, both to be held in Chengdu, China in September 2017.

- Peru (Chair) suggested that the Committee further elaborates guidelines to measure destination competitiveness for the upcoming work period (2018-2019). The guidelines will facilitate a methodology to evaluate the quantitative and qualitative factors at destination level without having the objective of making a ranking.
- This proposal shall be subject of further discussion during the 6th (face to face) Meeting of the CTC envisaged to take place during the 22nd Session of the General Assembly (4-9 September 2017, Chengdu, China).

D. Committee on Statistics and Tourism Satellite Account (CTSA)

1. Function

“The United Nations recognizes UNWTO as the appropriate organization to collect, to analyze, to publish, to standardize and to improve the statistics of tourism, and to promote the integration of these statistics within the sphere of the United Nations system.”

The Statistics Committee is a subsidiary advisory body of the Executive Council. As such, it contributes to the fulfilment of Article 13, paragraph 3 of the Agreement signed between the United Nations and UNWTO (above)

Its main mission aims at:

- proposing initiatives related to the **design** and **implementation** of tourism statistics international standards;
- promoting **international comparability** of tourism statistics by proposing initiatives relative to the collection, homogeneity, processing and dissemination of data;
- supporting **efforts to integrate** such data into the frameworks of the system of national tourism statistics and the Tourism Satellite Account;
- helping member countries in their initiatives to **improve** their respective **national systems of tourism statistics** (STS) and in the development of the Tourism Satellite Account (TSA);
- liaising with other international bodies with delegated responsibilities for **leadership** and **coordination** of related international statistics and their standards within sphere of the UN system.

1.1 Achievements

- UN measurements standards:
Measurement of the economic dimension of tourism (*International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics* (IRTS) and *Tourism Satellite Account* (TSA))
- Compilation guide of *International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics* (IRTS)
- Guide with Best Practice: Measurement Employment in the tourism Industries

1.2. Main current activities

a. *Measuring Sustainable Tourism (MST)*

With the support of the United Nations Statistics Division, UNWTO has launched the work *Towards a Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism (MST)*.

The aim is to develop an international statistical framework for measuring tourism's role in sustainable development, including economic, environmental and social dimensions.

This statistical framework will provide an integrated information base to better inform on sustainable tourism, to facilitate dialogue between different sectors and to encourage integrated, locally relevant decision making.

b. Implementation Guidance

- TSA
 - MST
- TSA Compilation Guide
Technical note on linking two standards:
Tourism Satellite Account (TSA) and the System of Environmental-Economic Accounting (SEEA)

c. Landmark event - In the context of the 2017 the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development

The Government of the Philippines and the World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) are organizing the 6th International Conference on Tourism Statistics to be held in Manila from 21 to 24 June 2017 with the objective of addressing the issue of the measurement of sustainable tourism.

The conference will be an opportunity to discuss the methodological advances and explore emerging issues. Notably, UNWTO will be presenting the 1st version of a Statistical Framework on Measuring Sustainable Tourism.

The conference will start with a Ministerial Roundtable that will lead to a common Declaration on the importance to have credible figures and the need to develop statistics for measuring sustainable tourism.

d. UN Resolution on business statistics at the UN Statistical Commission (48th session, 7-10 March 2017)

UNWTO report for decision; the last time UNWTO had this honor was in 2008, when the TSA was approved.

The Commission expressed appreciation for UNWTO'S work on tourism statistics and stated the following priorities:

- The development of a Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism (MST), including development of a Technical Note on linking TSA and SEEA (environmental accounts);
- The development of a TSA Compilation Guide;
- Further the work on SDG indicators related to sustainable tourism; and
- Capacity building for measuring sustainable tourism, notably in compiling TSA.

2. Members and terms of office (2015 – 2019)

Chair: Austria (2016-2017)

Vice-Chair: Georgia

- **Africa:** Mozambique, South Africa
- **Americas:** Brazil, Chile, Peru
- **East Asia and the Pacific:** Philippines
- **Europe:** Austria, France, Georgia, Spain (**chair 2018-2019**)
- **Middle East:** Saudi Arabia

- **South Asia:** India
- **Representative of the Associate Members:** Macao, China (2017)
- **Representative of the Affiliate Members:** Chairman of the Affiliate Members Board, Consolidated Tourism and Investment Consultants Limited (CTICO), Jamaica

3. Meetings

The [17th meeting of the Committee on Statistics and Tourism Satellite Account](#), was held at UNWTO's Headquarters in Madrid, Spain, on 24-25 January 2017

ANNEX I

Reports of the Programme and Budget Committee

A. Report of the Programme and Budget Committee submitted to the 103rd session of the Executive Council, 9-11 May 2016 (document CE/103/4)

Introduction

The Programme and Budget Committee (PBC) held its ninth meeting in Málaga, Spain, on 9 May 2016, under the chairmanship of Argentina. A list of participants is annexed to this report.

The PBC members proceeded to consider the following points and corresponding documents, which are to be submitted to the Executive Council at its 103rd session (10 May 2016):

	Documents
Report of the Secretary-General: Implementation of the General Programme of Work	CE/103/5 rev.2
Preparations for the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development 2017	CE/103/3(d)
Guidelines for the preparation of the 2018-2019 Programme of Work and Budget	No document
Financial situation of the Organization for 2016 (including Addendum 1: IPSAS post-implementation phase progress report)	CE/103/7(a) and CE/103/7(a) Add.1
UNWTO financial report and audited Financial Statements for the year ended 31 December 2015	CE/103/7(b)
Application of Article 34 of the Statutes and paragraph 13 of the Financing Rules	CE/103/7(c)
Human resources report	CE/103/7(e)

Implementation of the General Programme of Work

The Executive Director for Programme and Coordination presented an update of the activities carried out by the Secretariat since the last PBC meeting (September 2015), based on the documents of the Executive Council. The PBC took note of all activities presented in the report and recommended that the Executive Council approve it.

Preparations for the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development 2017

The Executive Director for Operational Programmes and Institutional Relations presented the Plan for the Observance of the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development 2017, outlining the key objectives, planned activities by UNWTO, and proposed activities to be undertaken by governments, the private sector, academia, international organizations, NGOs and civil society, as well as tourists. The PBC took note of the report and recommended that the Executive Council approve it.

Guidelines for the preparation of the 2018-2019 Programme of Work and Budget

The Executive Director for Programme and Coordination explained how the Organization prepares its programme of work and budget every two years, including the conduction of a survey on priorities. He presented a tentative calendar for the whole cycle of preparation of the next Programme of Work and Budget.

The PBC members approved the calendar for the preparation of the 2018-2019 Programme of Work and Budget.

Costa Rica (observer) requested the floor to make the proposal to reconsider the practice of the zero nominal growth for the preparation of the budget for 2018-2019. It invited the Secretariat to prepare two different draft programmes of work and budget for next biennium: one following the current practice of zero nominal growth and another one based on a sensible increase of the Organization's budget linked to the programme of work. The Committee supported the proposal.

Financial situation of the Organization (CE/103/7(a) and CE/103/7(a) Add.1)

The Committee took note of document CE/103/7(III)(a) which provides financial information as at 31 March 2016.

The Committee noted that, as of the end of March, the level of assessed contributions received for the current year amounts to EUR 8,391,977. This represents 64 per cent of the assessed contributions receivable of 2016 (EUR 13,091,955) (52 per cent at 31 March 2015) and 74 per cent of the estimated contributions (EUR 10,900,000), and therefore income targets are expected to be met by year's end. After the addition of the budgetary allocation and the arrear contributions, the total budgetary income amounts to EUR 9,375,154 representing 73 per cent of the estimate plan of income for the year (EUR 12,847,000).

The Committee took note that contribution arrears collected as of 31 March 2016 were EUR 650,176, i.e., 54 per cent of the forecast amount (EUR 1,214,000).

The Committee also took note that the implemented expenditure amounted to EUR 11,734,997 out of which EUR 2,787,505 had been expended, and that EUR 8,947,492 had been committed until year end, staff costs included.

The Committee urged Members that have not yet complied with their financial obligations to take the necessary steps to pay their contributions for 2016 thereby averting delays that could hamper programme execution.

The Committee took note of the adjustments made by the Secretary-General on the structure of programmes for 2016. These adjustments have resulted in a modified distribution of appropriations per programme as reflected in Annex I of document CE/103/7(a).

The Committee recommends that the Executive Council approve the use of the Special Contingency Reserve (SCR) and the Replacement Reserve (RR) funding for: (i) the lobby reform project (SCR project) in replacement of the printing services project funding and, (ii) the measuring sustainable tourism & improving tourism data management and data collection project (RR project) instead of the Statistics Information System project, at unchanged levels.

The Committee noted that a new salary scale applicable to staff of the Professional and higher categories was adopted effective 1 January 2016, in accordance with the applicable provisions of the Staff Regulations and the Staff Rules. This scale represents no additional cost to the Organization because it is the result of adjusting upward by 1.08 per cent the base salary of this staff category while reducing by the same percentage the post adjustment, so that the overall remuneration (base salary plus post adjustment) remains unchanged.

IPSAS post-implementation phase progress report: The Committee noted the advances made on the IPSAS post-implementation phase project related to: (i) sustaining IPSAS compliance and maximizing IPSAS benefits and, (ii) enhancement of Athena (UNWTO financial management information technology system) and the pressure that these major business transformation projects put on the Secretariat, particularly under the area of Budget and Finance.

The Committee noted that the go-live of the Athena II plan is planned within the first semester of 2017.

The Committee encourages the Secretary-General to continue to advance in the IPSAS post-implementation phase project and continue reporting its progress to the EC.

I. UNWTO financial report and audited Financial Statements for the year ended 31 December 2015 (CE/103/7(b))

The Committee took note of the favourable opinion of the External Auditors that the UNWTO Financial Statements for the year ended 2015 present fairly the financial position of the UNWTO as at 31 December 2015 and the results of the operations for this period, in compliance with UNWTO Financial Regulations and Rules and International Public Sector Accounting Standards with one exception regarding the timing difference in the presentation of audit reports of the Themis Foundation. The Committee requested the Secretary-General to continue discussions with the External Auditors and the Government of Andorra to find a solution to the timing differences in the auditing of the Financial Statements of the Themis Foundation.

It requests the Executive Council to recommend that the General Assembly approve the UNWTO Financial Statements for the year ended 2015.

The Committee expressed its gratitude to the External Auditors (Spain) for their work.

The Committee took note that in the financial year 2015 the level of budgetary expenditure was maintained within the limit of approved appropriations and observed that the cash surplus was returned to the Working Capital Fund (WCF) to partially cover the advance made from the WCF in previous years.

It recommends the Secretary-General to continue in 2016 his approaches to Members that owe contributions to the Organization in order to secure their payment.

The Committee also took note of the transfers of the appropriations between major programmes of the budget and between programmes of the same major programme of the budget made by the Secretary-General for the period ended 31 December 2015 which have been recommended

by the Programme and Budget Committee and by the Executive Council members through a written consultation in accordance with Financial Regulation 5.3(a) and 5.3(b).

The Committee took note of the Secretary-General's intention to amend Detailed Financial Rule (DFR) IV.1 to read "...This contribution shall be considered miscellaneous revenue for the current financial period..." and to include a new DFR (DFR IV.6) on the application of collection of contributions to read "The application of collection of contributions is done from the oldest arrear to the most recent one except if otherwise indicated by the Member" as recommended by the External Auditors during the external audit of the 2014 UNWTO Financial Statements.

Suspension of membership in accordance with Article 34 of the Statutes and requests for temporary exemption from the application of paragraph 13 of the Financing Rules

The Committee took note that the Full Members, Lao People's Democratic Republic and Nicaragua had scrupulously complied with the commitments acquired with regard to the payment of their contributions up to and including the current year.

The Committee expressed its satisfaction that that Full Members Mali and the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia were no longer subject to the provisions of paragraph 13 of the Financing Rules and/or Article 34 of the Statutes since they had reduced their contribution arrears partially or in full.

The Committee approves the payment plan submitted by the Full Member Mauritania for the settlement of its arrear contributions.

The Committee further took note that in accordance with resolution A/RES/646(XXI) the provisions of Article 34 of the Statutes are once again applicable to the Full Members Guinea, Niger, Togo Uganda and Yemen, as well as to the Affiliate Members Fédération Inter-États des Syndicats des Agences de Voyages et de Tourisme de l'Afrique de l'Ouest et du Centre (FISAVET) and Fundação CTI Nordeste.

Human resources report

The Committee took note of the information provided in the human resources report of the Organization and invited the Executive Council to approve the amendments of the Staff Rules mentioned in paragraphs Annex I of document CE/103/7(e) "Revised Compensation Package for Professional and Higher Categories Amendments to the Staff Regulations and Staff Rules" in application of UNGA resolution A/RES/70/244 with dates of effect as indicated in this document. Furthermore the Committee requested the Executive Council to take note of the report of the Ethics Officer and to thank him for the work carried out.

Place and date of the tenth meeting of the PBC

The tenth meeting of the PBC will be held immediately before the 104th session of the Executive Council.

Actions to be taken by the Executive Council

1. The Executive Council is invited to approve the recommendations presented in the present report and corresponding documents.

Annex I. List of participants

I. Chair	
Argentina	Mr. Jose Gustavo Santos Minister Ministry of Tourism Ms. Ana Garcia Allievi Technical Assistant Ministry of Tourism
II. Members of the Committee	
France	Mr. Michel Durrieu Director Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Hungary	Mr. Joseph Nemeth Head Hungarian National Tourist Office
India	Mr. Suman Billa Joint Secretary Ministry of Tourism Mr. Vikram Misri Ambassador Embassy of India in Spain Mr. Pravir Chakravorty Director India Tourism
Japan	Mr. Yuichiro Masuda Director Embassy of Japan to Spain Mr. Koichi Takatsuki Director for International Tourism Relations Japan Tourism Agency, Ministry of Land, Infrastructure, Transport and Tourism Ms. Yuri Furusawa Vice Commissioner Japan Tourism Agency, Ministry of Land, Infrastructure, Transport and Tourism
Malaysia	Mr. Hong Peng Ong Secretary General Ministry of Tourism and Culture Mr. Khairulnizam Saad Senior Principal Assistant Secretary Ministry of Tourism and Culture Mr. Mohd Hafiz Khar Special Officer to Secretary General Ministry of Tourism and Culture
Mexico	Ms. Anabella Barbosa Chiñas Deputy Director for the International Organizations SECTUR
Saudi Arabia	Ms. Basmah Al-Mayman Manager of International Organizations & Committees Department Saudi Commission for Tourism & National Heritage

Representative of the Associate Members	Mr. Jan Korthout Director - Tourism Policy Advisor Flanders Department of Foreign Affairs Flanders
III. Observers	
Costa Rica	Mr. Hermes Navarro del Valle Chief of Investment attraction Costa Rica Tourism Institute
Palestine	Mr. Amer Odeh Ambassador Diplomatic Mission of Palestine in Spain
Paraguay	Ms. Carmen Silva Interim Director General SENATUR
Peru	Mr. Walter Vizarrata Deputy Director of Market Intelligence and Forecasting PROMPERÚ
Spain	Mr. José Leandro Consarnau Guardiola Under Director General for Technical International Organizations Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Cooperation Mr. Ricardo Losa Giménez Assistant Under Director General for Technical International Organizations Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Cooperation
Sudan	Mr. Mohammed Abdalla A. Ahmed Ambassador Embassy of the Republic of Sudan to Spain
Zimbabwe	Mr. Karikoga Kaseke Chief Executive Zimbabwe Tourism Authority Mr. Stuart H. Comberbach Permanent Secretary Office of the President and Cabinet
Affiliate Members	Mr. Alexandr Eliseev Russian Travel Guide Co. Ltd. Russian Federation
UNWTO Secretariat	
Mr. Taleb Rifai Secretary-General Mr Zoltan Somogyi Executive Director, Programme and Coordination Mr. Marcio Favilla Executive Director for Operational Programmes and Institutional Relations Mr. José García Blanch Director of Administration Mr. Philippe Lemaistre Chief, Programme and Coordination	

B. Report of the Programme and Budget Committee submitted to the 104th session of the Executive Council, 30 October-1 November 2016 (document CE/104/4)

Introduction

1. The Programme and Budget Committee (PBC) held its tenth meeting in Luxor, Egypt, on 30 October 2016, under the chairmanship of Argentina. A list of participants is annexed to this report.
2. The PBC members proceeded to consider the following points and corresponding documents to be submitted to the Executive Council at its 104th session (1 November 2016):

	Documents
Implementation of the General Programme of Work 2016-2017	CE/104/5(a)
Preparation of the General Programme of Work 2018-2019	CE/104/5(b)
Financial situation of the Organization for 2016	CE/104/7(a)
Addendum 1: Detailed Financial Rules	CE/104/7(a) Add.1
Application of Article 34 of the Statutes and paragraph 13 of the Financing Rules	CE/104/7(b)
Report on the reform of the Organization (White Paper implementation)	CE/104/7(c)
Report on the recommendations of the Joint Inspection Unit in 2015	CE/104/7(d)
Information and communication technologies at the Secretariat	CE/104/7(e)

Implementation of the General Programme of Work 2016-2017

3. The Executive Director for Programme and Coordination presented an update of the activities carried out by the Secretariat since the last PBC meeting (May 2016), based on the documents of the Executive Council. The PBC took note of all activities presented in the report and recommended the Executive Council to approve them, as well as specifically, but not only:

(a) To take note of the official Roadmap for celebrating the IY2017 and encourage all UNWTO Members, the private sector, academia, civil society and other tourism stakeholders to celebrate the IY2017 as well as to support, contribute to, and participate in UNWTO activities;

(b) To invite all Member States to respond to the public consultation on the Convention on the Protection of Tourists and the Rights and Obligations of Tourism Service Providers and to entrust the Secretary-General to continue with its elaboration as well as that of the draft Convention on Tourism Ethics; and

(c) To take note of the Rules for the Operation and Management of Observatories.

4. The Chair highlighted that the seventeen Sustainable Development Goals have a link with tourism, particularly the first one, i.e., fighting against poverty, for which tourism is in a position to play a major role. He emphasized that there are some places in the world where only tourism is able to provide an economic opportunity to local communities. The Vice-Chair, France, supported the statement made by Argentina and added that tourism plays a fundamental role in building peace around the world.
5. Mexico informed the Committee about the next meeting of the Conference of the Parties (Cancún, Mexico, December 2016), during which tourism ministers will reflect on the sector's role for the preservation of biodiversity.

Preparation of the General Programme of Work 2018-2019

6. The Executive Director for Programme and Coordination presented the preparatory calendar of the General Programme of Work 2018-2019, including the survey on priorities drafted by the Secretariat taking into account the comments sent by the PBC Members.
7. The members of the Committee approved both the survey and the calendar and urged all UNWTO Members to complete the online survey to allow a more inclusive and representative picture of everyone's needs.

Financial situation of the Organization for 2016

8. The Committee took note of document CE/104/7(a) which provides financial information as at 30 June 2016.
9. The Committee noted that, as of the end of June, the level of assessed contributions from Full, Associate and Affiliate Members received for the current year amounts to EUR 9,908,913. This represents 76 per cent of the assessed contributions receivable of 2016 (EUR 13,091,955) (75 per cent at 30 June 2015) and 88 per cent of the estimated contributions (EUR 11,300,000), and therefore income targets are expected to be met by year's end. After the addition of the budgetary allocation and the arrear contributions, the total budgetary income amounts to EUR 11,052,238 representing 86 per cent of the estimate plan of income for the year (EUR 12,847,000).
10. The Committee took note that contribution arrears collected as of 30 June 2016 were EUR 810,325, i.e., 67 per cent of the forecast amount (EUR 1,214,000).
11. The Committee also took note that the implemented expenditure amounted to EUR 12,281,045 out of which EUR 5,840,921 had been expended, and that EUR 6,440,124 had been committed until year end, staff costs included.
12. The Committee urged Members that have not yet complied with their financial obligations to take the necessary steps to pay their contributions for 2016 thereby averting delays that could hamper programme execution.
13. The Committee took note of the adjustments made by the Secretary-General on the structure of programmes for 2016. These adjustments have resulted in a modified distribution of appropriations per programme as reflected in Annex I of the document.
14. The Committee recommends that the Executive Council approve the implementation of the Initiative projects as decided by the Secretary-General and the use of the Special

Contingency Reserve (SCR) to fund the project to replace the flooring of the Headquarters building in lieu of the renovation of the ninth-floor meeting rooms.

15. The Committee noted that an updated salary scale and dependency allowance for staff in the General Service category will be applied by the Secretary-General when the relevant scale is formally notified by the ICSC and that the new compensation package for staff in the Professional and higher categories will be applied by the Secretary-General as shown in CE/DEC/12(CIII) unless other application dates are approved by the UN General Assembly.
16. Detailed Financial Rules: The Committee requested the Executive Council to approve the amendments of the UNWTO Detailed Financial Rules as presented in document CE/104/7(a) Add.1 to enter into force as per dates of effect indicated in document CE/103/7(e).

Application of Article 34 of the Statutes and paragraph 13 of the Financing Rules

17. The Committee took note that the Full Members the Lao People's Democratic Republic and Nicaragua had scrupulously complied with the commitments acquired with regard to the payment of their contributions up to and including the current year.
18. The Committee expressed its satisfaction that Full Member Gabon was no longer subject to the provisions of paragraph 13 of the Financing Rules since it had partially reduced its contribution arrears.
19. The Committee approves the payment plan submitted by Guinea Bissau and Kyrgyzstan for the settlement of their arrear contributions.
20. The Committee further took note of the negotiations being held between the Secretariat and Full Members Afghanistan, Bahrain, Equatorial Guinea, Guinea, Guinea Bissau, Sierra Leona, the Syrian Arab Republic, Turkmenistan and Yemen for the settlement of their arrears.

Report on the reform of the Organization (White Paper implementation)

21. The Executive Director for Programme and Coordination recalled the role played by the PBC, at the request of the Executive Council, in evaluating JIU recommendations up to 2014 and presented an overview of the different recommendations and their level of progress. The PBC took note of the actions proposed by the Secretariat in the report and recommended that the Executive Council approve it.

Report on the recommendations of the Joint Inspection Unit in 2015

22. The Committee took note of the reports and the management letter issued by the Joint Inspection Unit in 2015 and supported the Implementation Plan carried out in the White Paper as per decision CE/DEC/7(XCIV).
23. It welcomed the JIU's constructive approach in its recommendations addressed to smaller agencies and requests the Executive Council to approve the actions to be taken on each of them and the Secretary-General to report accordingly.

Information and communication technologies at the Secretariat

24. The Committee took note of the audit report on the status of ICT activities and invited the Executive Council to take note of the progress in the technology infrastructure already implemented by the Organization as well as of the challenge a rapidly evolving technology environment and budgetary constraints represent.

Place and date of the eleventh meeting of the PBC

The eleventh meeting of the PBC will be held immediately before the 105th session of the Executive Council, in Madrid, Spain.

Actions to be taken by the Executive Council

25. The Executive Council is invited to approve the recommendations presented in the present report and corresponding documents.

Annex I: List of participants

I. Chair	
Argentina	<p>Mr. Jose Gustavo Santos Minister Ministry of Tourism</p> <p>Ms. Romina Nardi Director Ministry of Tourism</p>
II. Members of the Committee	
Angola	<p>Ms. Cláudia Marisa Santos Liberato First Secretary Embassy of Angola in Spain</p>
France (Vice Chair)	<p>Mr. Michel Durrieu Responsible for Tourism Ministry of Foreign Affairs</p>
India	<p>Mr. Suman Billa Joint Secretary Ministry of Tourism</p> <p>I.R.V. Rao India Tourism Johannesburg Ministry of Tourism</p>
Japan	<p>Mr. Yasuto Kawarabayashi Vice Commissioner Japan Tourism Agency Ministry of Land, Infrastructure, Transport and Tourism</p> <p>Ms. Yui Toyonaga Official Japan Tourism Agency Ministry of Land, Infrastructure, Transport and Tourism</p> <p>Mr. Koichi Takatsuki Director for International Tourism Relations Japan Tourism Agency Ministry of Land, Infrastructure, Transport and Tourism</p> <p>Mr. Yuji Toyama Second Secretary Embassy of Japan in Egypt</p>
Malaysia	<p>Mr. Hasbullah Rashidi Deputy Secretary General for Tourism Ministry of Tourism and Culture</p> <p>Mr. Saad Khaironizam Senior Principal Assistant Secretary Ministry of Tourism and Culture</p>
Mexico	<p>Mr. Javier Guillermo Head of Unit, International Cooperation SECTUR</p> <p>Mr. Hesiquio Benitez Director General, International Cooperation and Implementation National Commission for Knowledge and Use of Biodiversity</p>

Saudi Arabia	Ms. Basmah Al-Mayman Manager of International Organizations & Committees Department Saudi Commission for Tourism & National Heritage
Representative of the Associate Members	Mr. Jan Korthoudt Director – Tourism Policy Advisor Flanders Department of Foreign Affairs Flanders
Representative of the Affiliate Members	Mr. Edmund Bartlett Consolidated Tourism and Investment Consultants Limited (CTICO) Jamaica
III. Observers	
Armenia	Mr. Mekhak Apresyan Head of Department Ministry of Economy
Brazil	Mr. Rafael Augusto Luisi de Oliveira Special Advisor for International Relations Ministry of Tourism
Italy	Ms. Alessandra Priante Head of International Relations Ministry of Culture, Cultural Heritage and Tourism
Jamaica	Ms. Jennifer Griffith Permanent Secretary Ministry of Tourism
Kenya	Mr. Bramwel Waliaula Kisuya Ambassador Embassy of the Republic of Kenya in Spain
Tunisia	Mr. Walid Lassoued Counsellor Embassy of the Republic of Tunisia in Egypt
Zimbabwe	Mr. Douglas Mavhembu Deputy Director Ministry of Tourism and Hospitality Industry
League of Arab States	Mr. Abdullah M. Al-Zabidy Diplomatic Attaché, Economic Sector
ST-EP	Ms. Ambassador Dho Chairperson
UNWTO Secretariat	
<p>Mr. Taleb Rifai, Secretary-General</p> <p>Mr Zoltan Somogyi, Executive Director for Programme and Coordination</p> <p>Mr. Marcio Favilla, Executive Director for Operational Programmes and Institutional Relations</p> <p>Mr. Shanzhong Zhu, Executive Director for Technical cooperation and Services</p> <p>Mr. Carlos Vogeler, Executive Director for Members Relations</p> <p>Mr. José García Blanch, Director of Administration</p> <p>Ms. Yolanda Perdomo, Director, Affiliate Members Programme</p> <p>Mr. Philippe Lemaistre, Chief, Programme and Coordination</p> <p>Ms. Alicia Gómez, Legal Officer</p>	

ANNEX II

Report of the Committee on Tourism and Sustainability

1. The sixth meeting of the Committee was held via teleconference on 1 March 2016 with the participation of representatives from Bhutan, China, Colombia, Lithuania and Oman, and the representative of the Affiliate Members, the International Youth and Hostel Federation. During the meeting, the Secretariat provided the members with an overview on the previous and future activities of the Committee.
2. In this regard, reference was made to the report on the *Promotion of sustainable tourism, including ecotourism for poverty eradication and environment protection*, being prepared by UNWTO in 2016, in response to the UN resolution 69/233 on the same issue, for which the CTS Members were consulted and validated the work prepared by the Secretariat. It was pointed out that the CTS Members would also be involved in the preparation of the 2017 report on the implementation of UN resolution 70/196, entitled "Sustainable tourism and sustainable development in Central America".
3. An update on the Rules for the Operation and Management of the UNWTO International Network of Sustainable Tourism Observatories (INSTO), submitted to the last session of UNWTO GA, was provided. It was mentioned that since 2004, a total of ten UNWTO Observatories had been established: eight in China, one in Greece and one in Mexico. The observatories in process of incorporation were: the Observatory of Sustainable Tourism and Climate Change, in la Ceiba, Honduras; Iguassu Tri-National Tourism Observatory and Observatories in Brazil and in the Danube region¹. Furthermore, many expressions of interests had been received (eleven), which showed the need for further guidance on monitoring and measuring different issue areas covering all pillars of sustainability.
4. Regarding the Sustainable Tourism Programme (STP) of the 10-Year Framework of Programmes on Sustainable Consumption and Production Patterns (10YFP STP), it was highlighted that the programme was promoting the development of two lines of projects contributing to the achievement of the overall objectives of the 10YFP STP. The intended two lines of projects were Flagship projects and Catalytic projects. The call for project proposals to the 10YFP Trust Fund was issued last year; it received over 300 proposals out of which 120 were eligible. They were being evaluated and the final result was going to be communicated in due course.
5. The Secretariat informed the CTS Members that, in the absence of an Elected Chair, the Vice-Chair would function as an Acting Chair during the mandate.
6. The seventh meeting of the CTS took place on 24 June 2016 with the participation of representatives from China, Colombia and Morocco, and the representative of the Affiliate Members, International Youth and Hostel Federation. A representative of Chile joined as Observer.

¹ To date, there are sixteen observatories under operation: eight in China, one in Greece, one in Mexico, one in Brazil, three in Indonesia, one in Croatia and one in South Florida.

7. At the meeting, the Secretariat reported on the INSTO Open Consultation Meeting on Advancing the Measurement of Sustainable Tourism Development, which took place on 7-8 June 2016 and informed the Members on the issues discussed and experiences presented. It was said that UNWTO welcomed more than 70 experts at its Headquarters in Madrid, to discuss and share experiences related to the measurement and monitoring of the impact that tourism has on destinations. Special focus was put on the relevance and the opportunities available from non-traditional data sources, including social media analysis, geospatial data mapping, big and live data collection and usage, as well as the analysis of credit card spending patterns and the flow of visitors based on mobile device information.
8. It was highlighted that the consultation took place in the context of recent achievements that underline and strengthen the role and responsibilities of sustainable tourism as a positive instrument for development such as the recently adopted Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) as well as the upcoming International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development, 2017. The two day meeting included presentations and discussions covering, among others, the processes of measuring sustainable tourism at the local level, common challenges and needs and the chances deriving from different data sources.
9. It was mentioned that, due to the fact that many of the CTS Members participate in major tourism international fairs, the Secretariat was proposing to organize the next CTS meeting in-person and in conjunction with one international event.
10. The Committee members, being informed of Chile's wish to participate in the technical committee as observer, welcomed the representative of Chile.
11. The Public Meeting of the CTS on the Occasion of the Official Opening of the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development took place in Madrid on 18 January 2017 in the framework of FITUR. It counted with the participation of representatives from China, Colombia (the Acting Chair, represented by the Vice Minister of Tourism, Ministry of Commerce, Industry and Tourism of Colombia), Lithuania, Morocco (the Secretary General of the Ministry of Tourism) and the representative of the Affiliate Members, International Youth and Hostel Federation as well as with distinguished invited experts, which included the Vice Minister of Tourism, Ministry of Foreign Trade and Tourism of Peru; the Undersecretary for Policy and Tourism Planning of the Mexico's Federal Secretariat of Tourism (SECTUR) and representatives from Sun Yat-sen University in China and the State Company for Tourism Technology and Innovation Management (SEGITTUR) of Spain.
12. The role of the CTS as a consultation mechanism of UNWTO was recalled, underlining the special format of its eighth meeting which had been extended to the public on the occasion of the official opening of the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development.
13. At the meeting it was stressed that sustainability is a process of continuous improvement which is vital to our sector long-term success and for fulfilling its role as an agent of change.

14. Participants learnt about the important work of the INSTO observatories and how they are positioning themselves as boosters of sustainability at destinations and as a functioning model for ensuring that tourism meet its full potential as a contributor to sustainable development.
15. The meeting stressed the vital importance of regular and timely measurement of tourism performance and of data monitoring and analysis as the foundation for policy development and implementation as well as the development of a holistic approach tackling the three dimensions of sustainability, particularly the socio-cultural dimension.

An update on the ongoing research on the inclusion of sustainable consumption and production patterns (SCP) into national tourism planning was presented. It was also highlighted the importance of data collection and of working closely with key stakeholders to help solve the local and global sustainability challenges relevant to the tourism sector.

ANNEX III

Report of the Committee on Tourism and Competitiveness (CTC)

I. Background

1. It is recalled that the **Committee on Tourism and Competitiveness (CTC)**, as a subsidiary organ of the Executive Council, was established at the 95th session of the Executive Council (Belgrade, Serbia, 27-29 May 2013).

2. Its Rules of Procedure and composition were approved by the Executive Council at its 96th session (Victoria Falls, Zimbabwe, 25 August 2013).

3. During the 21st session of the General Assembly (Medellín, Colombia, 12-17 September 2015) the new Members of the CTC were elected for the period of 2015-2019. Following the appointment of the CTC Members (CE/102/2(c)), Peru and Italy were elected as Chair and Vice-Chair, respectively.

4. Two (recent) meetings of the **UNWTO Committee on Tourism and Competitiveness (CTC)** – (a) 5th (In-person) Meeting (20 January 2017) and (b) 5th Virtual Meeting (2 March 2017) – provided a follow-up on the progress already achieved by the Committee. During both meetings, the CTC members reviewed the working document which outlined the potential lines of action regarding the draft list of quantitative and qualitative factors for destination competitiveness and discussed the list of definitions on some of the selected/prioritized tourism types. The Chair also presented a proposal for the work plan to be put in place for the period 2018-19 which mainly focuses on developing technical guidelines with the aim of assisting the UNWTO Members in their efforts to measure the competitiveness factors that they consider relevant to their situation. Once consensus is reached amongst its members, the CTC will submit the definitions on the prioritized tourism types to the statutory bodies of the Organization for endorsement.

II. Priorities

5. The key principles related to the work priorities of the Committee are to:

(a) Support the Organization in fulfilling its normative role;

(b) Provide a dialogue mechanism between the public and private tourism stakeholders and academia within a coherent framework to give guidance in building and strengthening tourism competitiveness policies and strategies;

(c) Build synergies and strategic alignments in the harmonization of the related activities of the Secretariat as well as other collaborating organizations/entities in order to ensure consistency and consensus in the delivery of the outputs and reinforce the official position of the Organization; and

6. Since its establishment, the CTC has focused its work mainly on assessing the current state of knowledge on the basic concept of **“tourism destination competitiveness”** and on identifying its key factors. This process has also included the identification, development and harmonization of concepts, models and operational definitions used in the **tourism value chain**. The objective is to lead to a validation process which will reinforce the normative role of the Organization while the technical outputs and recommendations can be used by the UNWTO Members for different purposes such as measuring, labelling and/or benchmarking.

III. Definitions

7. During its previous term 2013-2015, on the basis of the input provided by the UNWTO Secretariat, the **Committee on Tourism and Competitiveness (CTC)** elaborated and agreed upon the following definitions, namely: **Tourism Destination, Destination Management/Marketing Organization (DMO), Tourism Product, Tourism Value Chain, Quality of a Tourism Destination, Innovation in Tourism and Competitiveness of a Tourism Destination**. These definitions were endorsed by the 103rd Executive Council held in Málaga, Spain, on 9-11 May 2016 and will be submitted to the 22nd Session of the General Assembly (Chengdu, China, 4-9 September 2017) for approval:

(a) Tourism Destination:

A Tourism Destination is a physical space with or without administrative and/or analytical boundaries in which a visitor can spend an overnight. It is the cluster (co-location) of products and services, and of activities and experiences along the tourism value chain and a basic unit of analysis of tourism. A destination incorporates various stakeholders and can network to form larger destinations. It is also intangible with its image and identity which may influence its market competitiveness.

(b) Destination Management/Marketing Organization (DMO):

A Destination Management/Marketing Organization (DMO) is the leading organizational entity which may encompass the various authorities, stakeholders and professionals and facilitates tourism sector partnerships towards a collective destination vision. The governance structures of DMOs vary from a single public authority to a public/private partnership model with the key role of initiating, coordinating and managing certain activities such as implementation of tourism policies, strategic planning, product development, promotion and marketing and convention bureau activities.

The functions of the DMOs may vary from national to regional and local levels depending on the current and potential needs as well as on the decentralization level of public administration. Not every tourism destination has a DMO.

(c) Tourism Product:

A Tourism Product is a combination of tangible and intangible elements, such as natural, cultural and man-made resources, attractions, facilities, services and activities around a specific center of interest which represents the core of the destination marketing mix and creates an overall visitor experience including emotional aspects for the potential customers. A tourism product is priced and sold through distribution channels and it has a life-cycle.

(d) Tourism Value Chain:

Tourism Value Chain is the sequence of primary and support activities which are strategically fundamental for the performance of the tourism sector. Linked processes such as policy making and integrated planning, product development and packaging, promotion and marketing, distribution and sales and destination operations and services are the key primary activities of the tourism value chain.

Support activities involve transport and infrastructure, human resource development, technology and systems development and other complementary goods and services which may not be related to core tourism businesses but have a high impact on the value of tourism.

(e) Quality of a Tourism Destination:

Quality of a Tourism Destination is the result of a process which implies the satisfaction of all tourism product and service needs, requirements and expectations of the consumer at an acceptable price, in conformity with mutually accepted contractual conditions and the implicit underlying factors such as safety and security, hygiene, accessibility, communication, infrastructure and public amenities and services. It also involves aspects of ethics, transparency and respect towards the human, natural and cultural environment.

Quality, as one of the key drivers of tourism competitiveness, is also a professional tool for organizational, operational and perception purposes for tourism suppliers.

(f) Innovation in Tourism:

Innovation in Tourism is the introduction of a new or improved component which intends to bring tangible and intangible benefits to tourism stakeholders and the local community, improve the value of the tourism experience and the core competencies of the tourism sector and hence enhance tourism competitiveness and /or sustainability. Innovation in tourism may cover potential areas, such as tourism destinations, tourism products, technology, processes, organizations and business models, skills, architecture, services, tools and/or practices for management, marketing, communication, operation, quality assurance and pricing.

(g) Competitiveness of a Tourism Destination:

The Competitiveness of a Tourism Destination is the ability of the destination to use its natural, cultural, human, man-made and capital resources efficiently to develop and deliver quality, innovative, ethical and attractive tourism products and services in order to achieve a sustainable growth within its overall vision and strategic goals, increase the added value of the tourism sector, improve and diversify its market components and optimize its attractiveness and benefits both for visitors and the local community in a sustainable perspective.

8. In fulfillment of its mandate received from the 103rd Executive Council (Málaga, Spain, 9-11 May 2016), the CTC also decided to further elaborate definitions on tourism types for review and consensus. The list of tourism types includes the following:

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Urban tourism b) Mountain tourism c) Rural tourism d) Cultural tourism e) Ecotourism f) Health tourism g) Wellness tourism h) Medical tourism i) Adventure tourism j) Business tourism (related to the Meetings Industry) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> k) Marine / Coastal tourism l) Nautical tourism m) Cruise tourism n) Spiritual tourism o) Gastronomy tourism p) Mega-events tourism q) Sports tourism r) Shopping tourism s) Education tourism
---	---

9. The above is an open list which may be enlarged upon the proposal of the CTC members during the process.

10. During the 5th CTC Virtual Meeting held on 2 March 2017, the CTC recommended to prioritize 10 tourism types from the list above with a view to start elaborating definitions which should be finalized by June 2017. The survey conducted among the CTC members on the 10 prioritized tourism types for further definition at this stage yielded the following results:

- 1) Cultural tourism
- 2) Ecotourism
- 3) Rural tourism
- 4) Adventure tourism
- 5) Health tourism
- 6) Business tourism (related to the Meetings Industry)
- 7) Gastronomy tourism
- 8) Marine/Coastal tourism
- 9) Urban tourism
- 10) Mountain tourism

Note: Upon the request of Gambia and Qatar, members of the CTC, “education tourism” and “sports tourism” will also be reviewed and incorporated in the list.

11. Once consensus is reached on part or all of the definitions, the proposal on the operational definitions shall be submitted to the 106th Executive Council and for approval by the 22nd session of the General Assembly, both to be held in Chengdu, China, in September 2017.

IV. List of factors

12. The Secretariat drafted a provisional list of relevant quantitative and qualitative factors to inform research and policy-making decisions regarding **tourism destination competitiveness**. These factors will be more discussed within the CTC in terms of their relevance and priority before moving towards further research.

13. The following list does not indicate any ranking in terms of the predominance of factors:

<i>Factors related to governance, management and the market dynamics</i>	<i>Factors related to destination appeal, attractors, products and supply</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Sustainable tourism policy and regulations, ii. Strategic planning, iii. Public Private Partnership + vertical cooperation i.e. national-regional-local levels, iv. Governance structure, v. Safety and security, vi. Hygiene and health facilities, vii. Investment and entrepreneurship policy, and the business environment, viii. Promotion strategies and tools, ix. Economic impact, x. Entry visa facilitation, xi. Labour productivity in tourism services and human resources development, xii. Budget allocated to support the tourism sector, xiii. Volume of accommodation facilities + related and supportive facilities, xiv. Demand trends and patterns (number of visitors, length of stay, tourism revenues, tourism expenditure, seasonality, etc.) xv. Use of information technologies, xvi. Knowledge management and research, xvii. Capacity for innovation in tourism, xviii. Accessibility for all xix. Political and economic stability xx. Others 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Geographical location and connectivity, ii. Natural resources, iii. Cultural resources (tangible, intangible), iv. Public and private amenities, v. Infrastructure, vi. Quality, vii. Local community awareness, hospitality, viii. Authenticity, ix. Seasonality, x. Ethical and responsible tourism products and services, xi. Destination image, xii. Destination brand, xiii. Positioning in the domestic market, xiv. Positioning in the international market, xv. Innovative products and services, xvi. Price competitiveness, xvii. Others

14. Based on the consensus reached by the CTC members with regards to the draft list of quantitative and qualitative factors for destination competitiveness listed above, the CTC agreed on several lines of action for each of the factors, categorized as follows:

- (a) Draft an operational definition, or
- (b) Draft a position paper / technical report (to be published), or
- (c) Compile the information and data from the already existing available sources.

15. The CTC will identify, if needed, and suggest other quantitative and qualitative factors for destination competitiveness to enlarge the list proposed by the Secretariat.

16. The CTC has decided to initiate drafting brief technical reports and/or position papers on the prioritized factors for competitiveness in tourism destinations.

V. Future action

17. At its 5th (In-person) Meeting held in Madrid, Spain, on 20 January 2017, Peru (Chair) suggested that the Committee further elaborate guidelines to measure destination competitiveness for the upcoming work period (2018-2019). The guidelines will facilitate a methodology to evaluate the quantitative and qualitative factors at destination level without having the objective of making a ranking.

18. This proposal shall be subject to further discussion during the 6th (In-person) Meeting of the CTC envisaged to take place during the 22nd session of the General Assembly (Chengdu, China, 4-9 September 2017) and a working document will be drafted for review and technical input.

19. The CTC also agreed to include in its work the input from other related areas in the Organization (i.e., Technical Committees, Affiliate Members Programme, etc.) as well as from other institutions and relevant tourism stakeholders to maintain consistency and legitimacy.

ANNEX IV

Report of the Committee on Statistics and Tourism Satellite Account

Seventeenth meeting
UNWTO Headquarters, Madrid, Spain, 24-25 January 2017

The [17th meeting of the Committee on Statistics and Tourism Satellite Account](#) gathered over fifty participants from 18 UNWTO Members States as well as Canada and Sweden, various UNWTO Affiliate Members and other representatives from academia, the private sector, regional tourism administrations and tourism observatories, in addition to the UN Statistics Division (UNSD), International Labour Organization (ILO), Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) and Eurostat.

Overview of the Committee on Statistics and Tourism Satellite Account

The Committee is a subsidiary advisory body of the Executive Council. As such, it contributes to the fulfilment of the [Agreement](#) signed with the United Nations whereby UNWTO became a UN specialized agency (Art. 13):

The World Tourism Organization recognizes that the United Nations is the central agency for the collection, analysis, publication, standardization and improvement of tourism statistics serving the general purposes of international organizations.

The United Nations recognizes UNWTO as the appropriate organization to collect, to analyze, to publish, to standardize and to improve the statistics of tourism, and to promote the integration of these statistics within the sphere of the United Nations system.

Consequently, the Executive Council requires the collaboration of the Committee in:

- initiatives related to the design and implementation of international tourism statistics recommendations;
- promoting international comparability of tourism statistics by proposing initiatives relative to the collection, homogeneity, processing and dissemination of data;
- supporting efforts to integrate such data into the frameworks of the system of national tourism statistics and the Tourism Satellite Account (TSA);
- helping member countries in their initiatives to improve their respective national systems of tourism statistics and in the development of the TSA;
- liaising with other international bodies with delegated responsibilities for leadership and coordination of related international statistics and their standards within the sphere of the UN system.

The Committee on Tourism Statistics and TSA has existed since the early 1990s and has a strong track record of professionalism, worldwide consensus building and pioneering developments, such as:

- The International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008
- The Tourism Satellite Account: Recommended Methodological Framework 2008
- The ongoing work towards a statistical framework for measuring sustainable tourism.

The Committee reports to the UN Statistical Commission, the highest decision making body in statistics. The Committee meets physically once a year, traditionally at UNWTO Headquarters, and works with its Secretariat, UNWTO's Statistics and Tourism Satellite Account Programme, throughout the year.

The Committee, held in January 2017, considered the following items **for discussion**:

1. The Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism (MST) under development
2. Measuring tourism at subnational levels
3. Sustainable Development Goals indicators
4. UNWTO's Programme of Work, including the official report to the UN Statistical Commission and the planned development of a TSA Compilation Guide

1. Towards a Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism (MST)

The Committee was informed of the progress on MST, including:

1. annotated outline of the Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism (SF-MST),
2. annotated outline and tables for the technical note on System of Environmental-Economic Accounting (SEEA) and TSA,
3. the discussion paper "Allocation of environmental flows to tourism",
4. proposed MST research programme, and
5. progress on pilot studies and countries' progress (Canada, Italy and The Netherlands were presented and the work of Fiji, Mexico and Wales/UK was referred to)

The Committee was informed about the Working Group of Experts (WGE) on Measuring Sustainable Tourism whose formation was welcomed by the Committee in its 16th meeting (26-27 January 2016) and subsequently set up by UNWTO with the support of UNSD. The Committee endorsed the conclusions of the 1st meeting of the WGE, emphasizing that:

- developing a Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism (SF-MST) is a priority;
- the core rationale for developing a statistical framework is to support the measurement of sustainable tourism in its various dimensions (economic, environmental and social) and at the relevant spatial levels (global, national, sub-national) by providing a common language for integration and an organizing structure;
- integrated data is needed to support integrated policy responses at national and subnational level;
- the statistical framework should make use of the richness of data already available;
- SF-MST is the natural evolution of and complement to the existing statistical standards on tourism statistics (TSA and IRTS);
- the starting foundation of MST is the bridging of economic and environmental dimensions through the linking of the TSA and the System of Environmental Economic Accounting (SEEA);

- the work will form a solid foundation for integrating in time the social and cultural dimensions (like the ongoing work on Cultural Satellite Accounting), notwithstanding, social and cultural data can already be considered in the framework acknowledging that these will for the moment not be sourced from an integrated framework;
- a standards-based statistical framework will support the credibility, comparability and outreach of data and of various measurement and monitoring programmes pertaining to sustainable tourism, including the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) indicators.

The Committee approved the Research Agenda, noting the need to develop a realistic work plan for the coming 1-2 years that reflects UNWTO's limited resources and welcoming suggestions from the group to set priorities.

The Committee warmly welcomed the pilot study work, highlighting that continued testing in countries of the relevance and feasibility of the framework under development is fundamental.

Overall, the Committee enthusiastically supported the work of the Working Group of Experts towards a Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism.

The Committee requested the progress to be taken to the next UNWTO Executive Council with the recommendation for the Council to support the conclusion by the Working Group of Experts on Measuring Sustainable Tourism and the UNWTO Committee on Statistics and TSA that developing a Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism is a priority, and to request the Secretary General and the General Assembly for support in its further development.

2. Measuring tourism at subnational levels

The Committee was informed of initiatives towards the measurement of tourism at subnational levels, notably the work of INRouTe entitled "Tourism, territory and sustainability: a statistical insight at subnational levels".

The Chair of the Committee transmitted a note with his recommendations to the Committee on this item. Following the discussion, the Committee acknowledged that subnational measurement is key and commended INRouTe for the document which is an impressive collection of thoughts, ideas, recommendations, references and research that very well substantiates the importance of measuring tourism at subnational levels and venues for doing so. The Committee noted that the INRouTe document be considered draft and recommended further work to be done, agreeing that (further) developments of some key elements of subnational measurement be integrated in the forthcoming statistical framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism (following a systems approach) and a future TSA Compilation Guide.

The Committee encouraged all to provide comments to the INRouTe document as part of the global discussion process open until 28 February 2017.

3. Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) indicators

During the meeting, the Committee was informed of the status of development of SDG indicators by the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on Sustainable Development Goal Indicators (IAEG-SDGs). Concern was expressed on the recent modification made to indicator 8.9.2, which is now "Proportion of jobs in sustainable industries out of total tourism jobs", and concerns were

reiterated on indicator 12.b (“Number of sustainable tourism strategies or policies and implemented action plans with agreed monitoring and evaluation tools”). The Committee discussed the note prepared and agreed that it would serve as a statement by the UNWTO Committee to be shared by Chair with the IAEG-SDG and the UN Statistical Commission.

While the Committee generally supports the indicator framework proposed for Resolution, it feels there is a need to raise awareness about the issues confronting indicators 8.9.2 and 12.b. The Committee also hopes for closer collaboration with the IAEG-SDG on indicators related to sustainable tourism, and so as to link to the ongoing work towards a Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism. In this sense, there is the possibility of contributing to the process of the „annual minor refinements“ to indicators specified in para. 21 (c) of the UNSC Report of the IAEG-SDG (<https://unstats.un.org/unsd/statcom/48th-session/documents/2017-2-IAEG-SDGs-E.pdf>), or to the more „comprehensive review“ that will be submitted to the UNSC in 2020 according to para. 22 of the Report.

During the meeting, the Committee also stressed the importance that each member of the Committee informs the Chief Statistician of his/her country on the issue so that Chief Statisticians can voice these matters in the relevant platforms, notably the upcoming UN Statistical Commission in March 2017.

4. UNWTO’s Programme of Work, including the official report to the UN Statistical Commission and the planned development of a TSA Compilation Guide

The Committee was informed on the report of UNWTO on tourism statistics that will be circulated for discussion and decision at the UN Statistical Commission in March 2017. The report describes the planned development of the SF-MST to support more integrated measurement and policy in the context of the SDGs and also proposes the development of a compilation guide for TSA, and a technical note on linking the System of Environmental Economic Accounting (SEEA) and the TSA.

The Committee welcomed the UNSD and UNWTO initiative to work on a Compilation Guide for TSA, underlining that many countries would benefit from this. The outline for the guide has been circulated among the Committee Members, and it should be based on and build on existing relevant work.

The Committee was also informed of the Lunchtime Seminar “[Accounting and statistics for sustainable tourism](#)” that will be held during the Commission meeting and in the framework of the 2017 International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development.

The Committee welcomed all **items for information**:

1. 6th UNWTO International Conference on Tourism Statistics: Measuring Sustainable Tourism, Manila, the Philippines, 21-24 June 2017

The Philippines informed the Committee about the Sixth UNWTO International Conference on Tourism Statistics. Its theme and importance warranted its designation as official event of the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development, 2017. A first preliminary programme has been shared with the Committee but further work is needed. The Philippines and UNWTO have committed themselves to having the first draft of the SF-MST be presented at the Conference, in addition to the first draft of the technical note on TSA and SEEA and other central papers.

2. Opportunities and challenges from big data

Eurostat presented the lessons learnt from the ongoing work of the international Task Force on Big Data. It was recognized that Big Data offers many opportunities, and more specifically tourism statistics is an area that is at the frontline of developments on big data, but there are also risks associated (continuity, ownership, quality controls, managing high volumes of data, etc.).

3. Roundtable discussion on the so-called “sharing economy”

UNWTO's Tourism Trends and Marketing Programme presented its work and provisional findings on private tourism services through digital platform. The City of Vienna presented their innovative approach to the policy challenge of newly emerging booking platforms and the implications it had for accommodation statistics.

4. Various (country) presentations

Presentations were given of the excellent work being carried out by Canada, Italy, Mexico, Peru and The Netherlands as well NECSTouR, Sun Yat-Sen University, and University of the Aegean which all contribute to promote the use and further development of tourism statistics worldwide.