The World Tourism Organization (UNWTO), a United Nations specialized agency, is the leading international organization with the decisive and central role in promoting the development of responsible, sustainable and universally accessible tourism. It serves as a global forum for tourism policy issues and a practical source of tourism know-how. Its membership includes 156 countries, 6 territories, 2 permanent observers and over 500 Affiliate Members.

Measuring Sustainable Tourism: A Call for Action
Report of the 6th International Conference on Tourism Statistics
Manila, Philippines, 21–23 June 2017
Measuring Sustainable Tourism: A Call for Action
Report of the 6th International Conference on Tourism Statistics

Manila, Philippines, 21–23 June 2017
Acknowledgments

The 6th International Conference on Tourism Statistics was organized by the Government of the Philippines and the World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) in Manila in June 2017 as part of the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development 2017.

UNWTO wishes to express its deep gratitude to the Department of Tourism of the Philippines, especially H.E. Wanda Tulfo-Teo, Mr. Rolando Cañizal, Mr. Benito C. Bengzon and their wonderful team for their excellent cooperation and superb hospitality which made it possible to successfully hold this important event. Ms. Lisa Grace S. Bersales and her team of the Philippine Statistics Authority are warmly acknowledged for their invaluable support and contributions.

UNWTO warmly thanks all Ministers, Chief Statisticians, speakers, moderators and delegates who contributed the success of the event by sharing their knowledge and expertise.

On behalf of UNWTO, the conference was jointly organized by the Regional Programme for Asia and the Pacific under the supervision of Mr. Xu Jing and the Statistics, Trends and Policy Programme headed by John Kester. The Statistics unit was responsible for content development and coordination, led by Clara van der Pol and the UNWTO Committee on Statistics and TSA and its chair Mr. Peter Laimer. Special appreciation goes out to Mr. Carl Obst, Ms. Léandry Moreno, Ms. Teresa Ciller and Ms. Hyeon Jin Lee.

This report has been prepared for the occasion of the twenty-second session of the UNWTO General Assembly in Chengdu, China on 11–16 September 2017 by Mr. Tadayuki Hara and Mr. Carl Obst with input from the Department of Tourism of the Philippines. UNWTO’s Ms. Juliana Contreras and Ms. Léandry Moreno were responsible for editing and production.
# Table of contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foreword by Taleb Rifai</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreword by Wanda Tulfo-Teo</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manila Call for Action on Measuring Sustainable Tourism</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highlights of the Conference</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Way Forward</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>**Ministerial Roundtable</td>
<td>Roundtable of Chief Statisticians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministerial Roundtable: The importance of integrated data for tourism policy</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roundtable of Chief Statisticians: Why advance towards an MST Framework?</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conference sessions:</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 1: Understanding needs and putting data to use</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 2: Linking the economic and environmental measurement of tourism</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 3: Employment: a key aspect of the social dimension of sustainable tourism</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 4: Subnational measurement in the Philippines and around the world</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 5: Producing data on sustainable tourism</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 6: Tourism indicators for monitoring the SDGs</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Foreword by Taleb Rifai

More than 1.2 billion tourists crossed international borders in 2016 – the seventh consecutive year of growth for our sector – benefiting economies and communities globally. UNWTO forecasts that this figure will grow to 1.8 billion by 2030, heightening the collective need to ensure that in our sector growth and sustainability go hand-in-hand.

Recognizing this, in December 2015 the United Nations General Assembly declared 2017 the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development (IY2017). This year provides a unique opportunity to reaffirm our commitment to sustainability and move forward to ensure the positive impact of well-managed tourism on inclusive and equitable growth, sustainable development and peace.

To know if we are going in the right direction we need to accurately assess our impact in all three pillars of sustainability – economic, social and environmental. Measuring tourism’s impacts is the only way the sector can be sure of its contribution to reducing CO₂ emissions, improving how sites, infrastructure and carrying capacity are managed, and curbing the possible negative impacts that tourism may have on society.

The United Nations has called for statistics to be the base of the process to define indicators for the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), the 17 global goals that explicitly call for more integrated policies for sustainable development.

Integrated policies need integrated data. We need an integrated base for the three dimensions of sustainable tourism – economic, social and environmental – and we need a common language for measurement that is standardized across destinations, countries and regions.
With support from the United Nations Statistics Division, UNWTO has launched a Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism (MST) to support these aims. Overall, MST will help us to better inform our policies on sustainable tourism, create dialogue between different sectors and support better decision-making.

The launch of MST in Manila, the Philippines, on the occasion of the 6th UNWTO International Conference on Tourism Statistics – Measuring Sustainable Tourism, was a landmark moment. More than 80 countries committed, through the Manila Call for Action, to join us on this journey. This is a clear signal that the desire to move successfully towards measuring sustainable tourism can be realised through determination, leadership and collaborative action to develop and implement the MST Framework.

MST builds on the impressive work that has been done to advance tourism measurement over the past three decades. What is needed now is collection of more data sources, developing clear and unified concepts, and building technical capacity. For MST to proceed, active support from across nations, disciplines and sectors is vital. With this, MST can become a framework of meaningful and feasible indicators for making tourism a real agent of change, and a real contributor to the SDGs, the 2030 Development Agenda, and a new era of sustainable and inclusive development.

I would like to take this opportunity to thank the Government of the Philippines for their immense support and commitment to holding the 6th UNWTO International Conference on Tourism Statistics – Measuring Sustainable Tourism.

Taleb Rifai
Secretary-General, World Tourism Organization (UNWTO)
Foreword by Wanda Tulfo-Teo

I wish to congratulate all the men and women who have participated in the 6th UNWTO International Conference on Tourism Statistics which was held on 21–23 June 2017 in Manila, Philippines.

Your presence, profound inputs during the forum and significant contributions have once again positioned the Philippines at a vantage point on the issue of Global Sustainable Tourism Development.

The lively and engaging discussions among Tourism Ministers, Chief Statisticians, policymakers, experts and industry leaders at the Conference has reawakened environmental awareness, cultivated cooperation between peoples, and reinvigorated faith in the future. I am glad that we agreed that tourism is indeed a big economic and social driver for development, and that we must become responsible to ensure that the next generations will prosper as well.

The Manila Call for Action on Measuring Sustainable Tourism adopted at the conference should inspire and motivate all tourism stakeholders and the public and private sector partners to work together to formulate more defined tourism policies, develop relevant programs, implement institutional mechanisms and invest in data gathering and exchanges of information to optimize the impacts of tourism.

We encourage everyone to make another contribution by using the Measuring Sustainable Tourism (MST) project presented at the forum. This will enable us to develop a methodological framework to better assess the economic, social, and environmental impacts of our industry.

It is my fervent hope that everyone would be reminded that we have a stake, and we need to partake in the journey of transforming our global tourism industry to make it more sustainable and inclusive. May the information in this report serve as a springboard for more dialogues, researches and studies.

H.E. Mrs. Wanda Tulfo-Teo
Secretary, Department of Tourism, Philippines
Manila Call for Action on Measuring Sustainable Tourism

We, the representatives of tourism, economic, environmental and other related administrations, statistical institutes, international and regional organizations, the private sector, the academia and civil society, gathered at the 6th UNWTO International Conference on Tourism Statistics: Measuring Sustainable Tourism, organized by the Government of the Philippines and the World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) on 21–23 June 2017 in Manila, the Philippines, and on the occasion of the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development, 2017:

1. Acknowledge that sustainable tourism contributes to the three dimensions of sustainable development – economic, social and environmental – and to the 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) of the universal 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, as affirmed by the United Nations (UN) General Assembly when announcing the adoption of the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development, 2017.¹

2. Draw attention to the fact that tourism has become one of the fastest growing and most important economic sectors in the world, benefiting destinations and communities worldwide. With over 1.2 billion international overnight visitors and many more domestic visitors in 2016, the sector represents an estimated 10% of the world’s GDP and 1 in 10 jobs globally. This growth comes with the need to uphold the foundations of prosperity for tourism destinations: the rich natural resources of our planet and its diverse cultural heritage.

3. Recall that sustainable tourism is defined as “tourism that takes full account of its current and future economic, social and environmental impacts, addressing the needs of visitors, the industry, the environment and host communities”². Sustainable tourism should thus make optimal use of environmental resources, respect host communities and ensure viable, long-term economic operations so that benefits are equitably distributed among all stakeholders.

4. Recognize that sustainable tourism drives inclusive economic growth and social development by promoting entrepreneurship, creating jobs and fighting poverty, and can also encourage environmental protection, consideration of climate, cultural heritage preservation, and stronger peace and mutual understanding around the world, whilst leaving no one behind.

5. Recall that with the adoption of several UN General Assembly resolutions on the importance of sustainable tourism as a tool for development,³ the need to better understand and track progress towards a sustainable global tourism sector is more pressing now than ever.

6. Are mobilized by the strong conviction that credible and comprehensive data on sustainable tourism is key for effective evidence-based policies and management in order to surmount current challenges and capitalize on opportunities.
7. Appreciate the achievements made in tourism measurement over the past decades, in particular the two official UN statistical frameworks for measuring tourism adopted in 2008: the *International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008*⁴ and the *Tourism Satellite Account: Recommended Methodological Framework 2008*⁵. Together, these statistical frameworks enable countries to produce data that is credible and comparable – across countries, over time and in concert with other standards. These frameworks help integrate and organize data for the purposes of deriving indicators such as tourism GDP.

8. Advocate for the development of a Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism (MST Framework) that extends the current frameworks beyond their primarily economic focus, in order to incorporate environmental, social and cultural dimensions, across commonly agreed spatial levels (global, national and sub-national) and paying attention to temporal considerations.

9. Strongly believe that developing and implementing an MST Framework is the critical next step in understanding, analysing and supporting universal, cross-sectoral, sustainable tourism policies and practices that work from an integrated, coherent and robust information base.

10. Underline that the benefits of an MST Framework for decision makers and other stakeholders include:
   – The provision of a common language for discussing sustainable tourism within the tourism sector and with other key policy areas such as planning, industry, infrastructure, environment, social affairs, finance and central banks;
   – The capacity to compare the performance of the tourism sector and the impacts of different policies on a consistent basis with other sectors and in different destinations and countries;
   – The provision of a basis for improving co-ordination in data collection and compilation, as well as for improving institutional arrangements for the governance and management of statistics on sustainable tourism;
   – The provision of a single, coherent and comprehensive picture of the state of sustainable tourism and its trends, in all its dimensions and across commonly agreed spatial scales.

11. Welcome the preliminary draft of the MST Framework as a launch pad with which to further the global discussion, and appreciate the significant progress achieved to date through pilot studies and other relevant work at international, national and subnational levels (including local levels) presented at this Conference. This reaffirms our conviction that an MST Framework is not only highly relevant but also feasible and most welcome.

12. Emphasize that information from the Framework will improve our ability to support discussion on vital and urgent policy issues on sustainable tourism; including:
   – The use of resources for tourism purposes, including use of energy, water and land (such as rivers, lakes and coastal areas, protected areas and wildlife);
   – The management of solid waste, wastewater, emissions and pollution from tourism activity;
   – Infrastructure needs concerning transport, water, energy and waste;
   – Benefits and impacts of tourism on local communities, as well as on natural, cultural and heritage sites;
   – Tourism concentration and congestion in both mature and emerging destinations.
13. Acknowledge that designing and implementing an MST Framework is a priority in the context of measuring progress towards achieving the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and in response to the needs of governments and tourism stakeholders.

14. Recall that the United Nations recognizes UNWTO as the appropriate organization to collect, analyze, publish, standardize and improve the statistics of tourism globally, and to promote the integration of these statistics within the sphere of the UN system. In so doing, UNWTO works under the leadership of the UN Statistical Commission, with the assistance of the UN Statistical Division and in close cooperation with country experts and with other international organizations including ILO, OECD and EUROSTAT.

15. Appreciate the work of UNWTO as the leading UN Specialized Agency for tourism in advancing the development of an MST Framework through the Working Group of Experts on Measuring Sustainable Tourism, under the auspices of the UNWTO Committee on Statistics and Tourism Satellite Account, and in close cooperation with relevant partners and experts.

16. Welcome the support from the UN Statistical Commission, the highest decision-making body in statistics globally, in developing an MST Framework that includes indicators for sustainable tourism, measurement at sub-national level and pilot projects, as well as the development of a compilation guide for the Tourism Satellite Account and a technical note linking the Tourism Satellite Account and the System of Environmental-Economic Accounting.

17. Call upon all actors to facilitate the necessary means and resources for the development and subsequent in-country implementation of an MST Framework, noting the opportunities to tap into the richness of data currently available and identifying gaps for producing any additional data that may be needed.

18. Stress the need for building capacity towards measuring sustainable tourism, taking into account the constraints and challenges of implementing statistical systems in developing and developed countries.

19. Recognize with regard to data collection that all possible sources should be taken into account, including census, survey-based, administrative and innovative sources (e.g. big data).


21. Emphasize that, beyond being a technical exercise, the development and implementation of an MST Framework is a strategic and ongoing endeavour, requiring wide and consistent stakeholder engagement, collaboration, inter-institutional coordination and political leadership.

22. Welcome the establishment by UNWTO of a special funding mechanism through voluntary contributions for the purpose of the further development and implementation of the Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism.
During this 6th International Conference on Tourism Statistics: Measuring Sustainable Tourism in Manila, Philippines, we unite political commitment and gather technical expertise to call for the development and implementation of a Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism that includes economic, environmental and social dimensions across relevant spatial levels (global, national and subnational). We call upon other governments and administrations at national and subnational levels, international organizations, academia, private sector organizations and civil society to join our efforts.

We extend our sincere gratitude to our host, the Government of the Philippines, for its warm hospitality and excellent support and arrangements for the organization of the Conference, as well as its significant contribution to advancing the sustainable tourism agenda as a driver for sustainable development.

1 UN General Assembly resolution A/RES/70/193 adopted on 22 December 2015. See http://statistics.unwto.org/mst for further information and for links to the documents mentioned in this call for action.


3 For example resolution A/RES/69/233 (19 December 2014) which encouraged the promotion of sustainable tourism, including ecotourism, for poverty eradication and environment protection, and resolution A/RES/70/1 (25 September 2015) on Transforming our World: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, which adopted the 17 Sustainable Development Goals.


8 Such a special funding mechanism would operate under UNWTO’s Financial Rules and Regulations.
Introduction

On the occasion of the official launch of 2017 as the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development, United Nations Secretary-General António Guterres made clear the critical role that tourism plays in our world’s safe, secure, united and sustainable development, saying:

*Every day, more than three million tourists cross international borders. Every year, almost 1.2 billion people travel abroad. Tourism has become a pillar of economies, a passport to prosperity, and a transformative force for improving millions of lives. The world can and must harness the power of tourism as we strive to carry out the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.*

Despite the long-standing interest and discussion of sustainable tourism, and the important advances in tourism statistics, no standardized approach exists for the collection and comparison of relevant information, at either the national or subnational level. This is a significant gap, and one that limits the potential for the development of policies directed at advancing sustainable tourism. Evidence to support policy and track progress is critical.

It was in this context that the 6th UNWTO International Conference on Tourism Statistics brought together, for the first time, the global tourism, official statistics and sustainable development communities to discuss the measurement of sustainable tourism.
Being in Manila, the global tourism community has in fact come full circle. The journey to recognize and measure the impact of tourism actually began in Manila, almost 40 years ago. In 1980, the Manila Declaration on World Tourism came to life on 27 September – World Tourism Day. This marked a milestone in the recognition of tourism as a serious and significant social and economic force and, in concert, the recognition of the need for a universal approach to measurement.

In previous tourism statistics conferences – Ottawa (1991), Nice (1999), Vancouver (2001), Iguazu (2005) and Bali (2009) – the core components for the measurement of tourism were defined and established. This covered the definition of visitors, usual environment, tourism expenditure and tourism employment. Collectively, these definitions and the associated statistical frameworks underpin the international system of tourism statistics. In turn, this statistical system supports the measurement of tourism trends, the analysis of tourism activity, the development of tourism policy and, most importantly, ensures that tourism is understood within and outside the tourism community as a significant and growing economic and social reality.

It is clear however that the scope of the current system of tourism statistics is insufficient. The ever growing calls for sustainable development have seen landmark resolutions from the United Nations General Assembly. These are, most notably, the 2030 Development Agenda and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and, significantly for tourism, the affirmation of 2017 as the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development (IY2017) on 22 December 2015. These milestones and advances call for an expansion in the evidence base to support policy, track progress and further deepen our understanding of tourism activity.

With this clear motivation, the Conference brought together leaders and practitioners from around the world to raise awareness, secure commitment, garner support, demonstrate commitment, facilitate collaboration, and harness resources towards the measurement of sustainable tourism.

The Conference built on a wide range of measurement initiatives worldwide that have been drawn together through the Measuring Sustainable Tourism (MST) project which started in 2015 by
UNWTO, with the support of the United Nations Statistics Division (UNSD). MST has the aim of developing and implementing an international statistical framework for measuring tourism’s role in sustainable development.

In short, the **Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism** (MST Framework) aims to integrate and extend the current statistical frameworks beyond their primarily economic focus, to incorporate environmental and social dimensions at all relevant spatial levels: global, national and sub-national.

The MST Framework is a critical next step in supporting universal, cross-sectoral, sustainable tourism policies and practices that work from an integrated, coherent and robust information base. The MST Framework is also a response to the demand for high quality indicators for monitoring progress towards the SDGs. It will provide:

- A common language for discussing sustainable tourism within the sector, and with other key stakeholders and policymakers outside of tourism: infrastructure, environment, social affairs, finance and transport;

- The capacity to compare performance across nations;

- The basis for improving coordination, collaboration and healthy competition; and

- The ability to create a holistic picture, across the sector and across the world, reinforcing the quest to speak with one voice to magnify the impact of tourism as a force for good.
The Conference was a tremendous success with significant credit due to the wonderful hosting of the Philippine Government. Ultimately, nearly 1000 participants from across the globe, endorsed the Manila Call for Action on Measuring Sustainable Tourism. The Manila Call for Action is a common statement recalling the progress achieved to this point and the main areas to be addressed by the communities of tourism, economic, environmental and social ministries, statistical institutes, international and regional organizations, the private sector, the academia and civil society. It supports the need for credible and robust data and the need for statistics to substantiate tourism in national and international agendas and as a lever for the ongoing viability of the sector.

The present Conference report – Measuring Sustainable Tourism: A Call for Action – gives a taste of the key messages and findings from the Conference. Its release at the UNWTO General Assembly in September 2017 seeks to ensure that these messages and the undeniable enthusiasm for progress in this area are shared with the entire UNWTO family. This is by no means a dry statistical exercise, but rather, the development and implementation of the MST Framework will build a platform for engagement and action across all of the dimensions of sustainable tourism.
Highlights of the Conference

Opening Ceremony participants:

**H.E. Mrs. Wanda Tulfo-Teo**
Secretary, Department of Tourism, Philippines

**Mr. Pali J. Lehohla**
Special Envoy of the United Nations Statistical Commission

**Mr. Taleb Rifai**
Secretary-General, UNWTO

**Mr. Aquilino Pimentel III**
President, Senate of the Philippines

Closing Ceremony participants:

**Rapporteur: Mr. Tadayuki Hara**
Associate Professor, University of Central Florida

**Mr. Márcio Favilla**
Executive Director for Operational Programmes and Institutional Relations, UNWTO

**Mr. Benito C. Bengzon, Jr.**
Undersecretary for Tourism Development Planning, the Philippines

**Mrs. Lisa Grace S. Bersales**
National Statistician, Philippine Statistics Authority

The 6th UNWTO International Conference on Tourism Statistics marked a very significant milestone in tourism statistics. Over 70 speakers presented to over 1000 delegates from 88 countries and 9 international organizations and by sheer numbers alone this was a significant event in tourism statistics. More importantly, however, UNWTO and the hosts, the Government of the Philippines, recognized that the development and implementation of an MST Framework is very much a strategic endeavour that will require stakeholder engagement, inter-institutional coordination and political leadership, in addition to its technical requirements.

With this strategic focus in mind, the Conference Opening Ceremony saw key note addresses from distinguished speakers whom highlighted the significance of tourism in the Philippines, the importance of achieving sustainable development for local communities, the significance of high quality measurement and statistics, the responsibility of the tourism community to progress towards
environmentally and socially aware outcomes, the transformative power of tourism for peace and mutual understanding, the need for collective and collaborative action and the potential for greatness.

The Philippines is one of the leading tourism destinations in the world today. I trust that this Conference will lead to viable measures and policies that will truly protect delicate ecosystems, conserve cultural heritage, and ensure the development of sustainable and inclusive tourism in the Philippines. This is not only for the Filipinos but for everyone in the world who wants to experience the beauty and warmth of our country.

Mr. Rodrigo Duterte, President of the Philippines

Statistics is a conduit of trust. In times when facts are sometimes being challenged, society should be able to retain trust in the information communicated by the statistical agencies. The statistical community seeks to work closely together with all of the stakeholders, be it government, academia, private sector or civil society. It is our duty to provide relevant official statistics as an indispensable element in the information system of a democratic society.

Mr. Pali Lehohla, Special Envoy of the United Nations Statistical Commission

Following on from this inspiring opening session, and in keeping with the strategic focus, the Conference held two high-level Roundtables involving first Ministers and then Chief Statisticians. These two groups representing the political and the technical must work collaboratively. Facilitated by Ms Anita Mendiratta, Special Advisor to the UNWTO Secretary-General, the Ministerial Roundtable reinforced the need for robust and credible statistics such that the tourism community can talk with one voice. Secretary-General Rifai spoke of the journey to well-being that we are on and the need for scientific evidence and a common language to support our understanding. All Ministers highlighted the need to involve community and people in finding appropriate solutions and spoke to their motivation to use tourism as an avenue to secure prosperity for future generations.

With billions of people traveling the world today, we belong to a group of believers. We’re a tribe. A tribe of travellers believing in the beauty of this world, the beauty and strength of our diversity, and in our right as humans to enjoy this beauty and diversity.

The transformative force of travel and tourism is a cornerstone in making this world a better place. Yet what we can’t measure – accurately and regularly – we can’t manage. We need to measure our impact and we need to know exactly what we are doing.

Mr. Taleb Rifai, Secretary-General of the World Tourism Organization
The second Roundtable involving Chief Statisticians conveyed the important role of the statistical community and the strength of their processes, the need for leadership towards new ways of data collection and dissemination, the importance of international standards and the potential for statistical advance and harmonisation in all countries in the wake of the new SDG linked paradigm. At the same time, the Roundtable outlined significant challenges including data integration across domains, translating sustainability messages to private sector actors and communities, and aligning global, national and destination level perspectives.

The Conference then proceeded through six technical sessions covering:

1. Understanding needs and putting data to use;
2. Linking the economic and environmental measurement of tourism;
3. Employment: a key aspect of the social dimension of sustainable tourism;
4. Sub-national measurement in the Philippines, and in the world;
5. Producing data on sustainable tourism; and
6. Tourism indicators for monitoring SDGs.

The wealth of material and messages conveyed in these sessions is summarised in this report.

The Conference Closing Ceremony brought all of these messages and findings together. Mr Márcio Favilla, Executive Director, UNWTO, recalled the leadership and vision of the Filipinos from 1980 to the present day, consistently laying the groundwork for the better understanding of the tourism sector. He recalled that the breadth of topics presented over the three days as further evidence “of the far-reaching transformative power of tourism and of the interconnected world in which we live”.
Then, in the context of advancing towards the 2030 Global Development Agenda and the five critical areas of the IY2017, Mr Favilla called for the adoption of the **Manila Call for Action on Measuring Sustainable Tourism**. The endorsement of this comprehensive statement by the Conference participants on the need for a statistical framework represents another significant milestone in tourism statistics.

> **This document – the Manila Call for Action on Measuring Sustainable Tourism – I embrace with my heart. This seems so technical – measuring sustainable tourism – but this represents the lives of the peoples of this planet. We in this hall will give great positive impact when we are able to actualize this.**
> Ms. Lisa Bersales, National Statistician, Philippine Statistics Authority

It is clear that development and implementation of the MST Framework is a collective endeavour requiring commitment, leadership and collaborative action. The enthusiasm and leadership evident throughout the Conference should be seen as a clear signal of the desire to move successfully towards measuring sustainable tourism.

> **Additional material with regards to the Conference such as papers, presentations, videos and photos are made available at: http://statistics.unwto.org/mstconference.**
The Way Forward

Moving forward on the development and implementation of the MST Framework may appear a daunting challenge. Undoubtedly there will be conceptual issues to resolve, data sources to find and technical capacities to build. However, we can take tremendous advantage of the fact that the MST Framework builds on the substantial advances in tourism measurement over the past 30 years, as well as progress in measurement in environmental and social domains. In linking together these various strands of work, the MST Framework cannot be considered to be starting from a zero base but rather must be considered as a part of the next generation of official statistics.

In practice, the development and implementation of the MST Framework will involve a number of streams of work. One stream will focus on the further design and development of the Framework itself and the associated statistical definitions and treatments. Using the preliminary draft of the MST Framework presented at the Conference, the work will turn to advancing this draft using additional input and material from the Conference and moving towards a first consultation draft in early 2018. This draft will be considered by relevant experts, under the management of the UNWTO Committee on Statistics and TSA (Tourism Satellite Account). Further research and refinement will be undertaken through 2018 and 2019 with ever-broadening engagement, including with data users. The target is the finalization of the MST Framework for submission to the UN Statistical Commission in March 2020.

The second stream of work undertaken in parallel with the development of the Framework, will be pilot and case studies at country and sub-national level. Already a number of countries have commenced work on pilot studies to test the basic tenets and early drafts of the MST Framework. This includes, most recently, the announcement by the Government of the Philippines at this Conference of their desire to become an MST pilot country. This pilot study work stream is essential since it will continue to examine the relevance and feasibility of the MST Framework in a variety of situations and, consequently, provide important practical insights that can be taken into account in finalizing the technical aspects of the MST Framework.
As we anticipate further growth in the coming years, we are keen in transforming tourism into an environmentally and socially responsible industry that gives high value to the protection of our environment, conservation and enrichment of Philippine culture, and improving the lives of our local communities. The theme of this Conference – Measuring Sustainable Tourism – is very much aligned to our vision in the 2016–2022 National Tourism Development plan. It is our vision to secure a better planet for our people, and to provide a better experience to our tourists and guests.

H.E. Wanda Tulfo-Teo, Secretary of Tourism of the Philippines

The third stream of work involves capacity building and implementation. As is normal in the development of new statistical frameworks, the design of the framework must precede its implementation. At the same time, since in this case the framework builds on existing measurement standards, it will be possible to begin a process of integrating MST capacity building with existing activities seeking to advance individual areas of statistics. For example, opportunities will be sought to link the development of MST capacity with implementation of the SEEA (System of Environmental-Economic Accounting) and TSA. The development of relevant materials and support will take place leading up to the finalization of the framework in 2020 and will take significant advantage of the experience of pilot countries in this process.

Ultimately, the single biggest factor in determining the success of the MST project will be the engagement and support of people across countries, across departments and disciplines, across sectors, and across roles – from ministers and executives to technical experts. Active support for this engagement process, as well as the individual work streams, is essential. To this end, UNWTO has nominated the MST project to be the flagship project for its 2018 resource mobilization efforts. This focus builds directly on the successful resource mobilization undertaken for IY2017 and indeed, the focus on MST in 2018 is one means by which the significant steps towards sustainable tourism launched in 2017 can be carried forward and embedded across the globe. Working collectively and collaboratively, as called for in the Manila Call for Action, will ensure that the development and implementation of the MST Framework can meet the expectations we have set so that we can realize the potential of sustainable tourism to positively influence the lives of millions of people and secure long term environmental benefits.
Ministerial Roundtable

Roundtable of Chief Statisticians

Conference sessions
Ministerial Roundtable:
The importance of integrated data for tourism policy

Introductory remarks by

Mr. Taleb Rifai, Secretary-General, UNWTO

Moderator: Ms. Anita Mendiratta, Special Advisor to the UNWTO Secretary-General

Participants: H.E. Mr. John Amaratunga, Minister of Tourism Development and Christian Affairs, Sri Lanka

H.E. Mrs. Wanda Tulfo-Teo, Secretary, Department of Tourism, Philippines

H.E. Ms. Kobkam Wattanavrangkul, Minister of Tourism and Sports, Thailand

Mr. Pali J. Lehohla, Statistician-General, South Africa

Ms. Anne Lafortune, Principal Secretary for Tourism, Ministry of Tourism, Civil, Aviation, Ports and Marine, Seychelles

H.E. Mr. I Gde Pitana, Deputy Minister for International Marketing, Ministry of Tourism, Indonesia

Mr. Navitalai Tuivuniwai, Trade Commissioner, Fiji

Ms. Young-Shim Dho, Chairperson, Sustainable Tourism for Eliminating Poverty (STEP)

Mr. Mario Hardy, CEO, Pacific Asia Travel Association (PATA)

Mr. Hwang Seong Un, Director General for International Tourism Policy, Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism, Republic of Korea

Mr. Dai Bin, President of China Tourism Academy and Director of the CNTA Tourism Data Center, China

Mr. Sérgio Guerreiro, Director, Knowledge Management & Corporate Affairs, Turismo de Portugal and Representing the European Travel Commission

Ms. Beatriz Marco Arce, Deputy Director for Tourism Intelligence, Spain Tourism Board (Turespaña), Spain

Mr. Alain Dupeyras, Head of Tourism, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)
The Ministerial Round Table brought together a distinguished group of 13 leaders from across the global tourism community, focusing on the opportunities and challenges of sustainable tourism and how the use of more integrated data is supporting them in paving the way towards a more sustainable future. The discussion represented an important milestone in bringing quantified awareness and credibility to the impact of tourism across economic, social and environmental dimensions.

The framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism will provide us with a common language. It’s not just for talking among ourselves, it’s making sure that non-tourism people understand the impact of tourism – people involved in infrastructure, in environment, in social affairs, in finance and in transport. Whatever our definition of sustainability, whatever our destination, MST is a tool that will give credibility to all we know to be true about the potential of tourism. MST is our legacy. In the words of Victor Hugo, “there is nothing more powerful than an idea whose time has come”.

Ms. Anita Mendirata, Special Advisor to the UNWTO Secretary-General

From the perspective of a Small Island Developing State, and a country where 1 in 3 persons directly or indirectly depend on tourism, we cannot stress enough the importance of MST. MST for us is a life saver. Even if all member countries in this room would back out from this initiative, I can guarantee that Fiji would still take it up. MST is a way of saving our resources and saving our people.

Mr. Navitatai Tulunivalu, Trade Commissioner, Fiji
Importantly, the Ministerial Roundtable acted as a critical scene-setter for the conference. The discussion started at a high level, with Ministers encouraged to share their personal, in-country experiences with the measurement of tourism sustainability, applying tourism data in the implementation of sustainable tourism objectives in national agendas.

Importantly, the occasion of IY2017 was perfect timing to emphasise key metrics of tourism’s role on sustainable development and the 13 global leaders were pleased to step forward and speak strategically, as well as politically, on the need for statistics to substantiate mainstreaming tourism in national and international agendas.

Key messages to the Conference from the Ministerial Roundtable were:

- The need to seek win-win between tourism growth and environmental protection rather than thinking in terms of trade-offs and balanced outcomes.

- That now is the time for adoption of the MST Framework. Mario Hardy, President and CEO of PATA, stated that MST is “the right thing to do”, and is critical to substantiating tourism’s value across multiple metrics. This point was reinforced by the Hon. Minister of Tourism and Sport of Thailand who stated clearly that “this is the future”. In this context, the opportunity of
IY2017 cannot be wasted. Never again will the global tourism community have the attention of the global UN system. Now is the time to embed critical principles, programmes and policies.

That MST Framework can be a global tool to support countries and destinations to define the what, why, for whom, for what purpose and when of measurement and, in doing so, provide a common language for the exchange of experience and the advancement of measurement and policy.

Ultimately, the adoption of an MST Framework will ensure that tourism has at its core, a robust source of data to verify the overwhelming qualitative rationale that it presents in being the most essential, invaluable sector of our times. The Ministerial Roundtable successfully embedded that, above all, the role of tourism as a force for good is indisputable. And with the MST Framework, the statistics are there to provide the proof.

We need to secure the human resources, the budget, and the institutional organization in addition to the methodological framework in order to make it happen.

Mr. Dai Bin, President of China Tourism Academy and Director of the CNTA Tourism Data Center, China

In Europe we like to see sustainable tourism as a sector that understands its role in the world. And that role is to put people at the core of every decision. We need to learn, adapt and improve.

Mr. Sérgio Guemeiro, Director, Knowledge Management & Corporate Affairs, Turismo de Portugal and Representing the European Travel Commission
Roundtable of Chief Statisticians:
Why advance towards an MST Framework?

Background document by
Ms. Clara van der Pol, Programme Coordinator, Statistics, Trends and Policy, UNWTO

Moderator: Ms. Lisa Grace S. Bersales, National Statistician, Philippine Statistics Authority

Participants:
Mr. Khalid Al Mudhaffar, Director General of Economic Statistics, National Centre for Statistics, Oman

Mr. Zachary Mwangi Chege, Director General, National Bureau of Statistics, Kenya

Ms. Elena Kukharevich, Deputy Chairman, National Statistical Committee, Belarus

Mr. Pali J. Lehohla, Statistician-General, Statistics South Africa

Ms. Titi Kanti Lestari, Director of Finance, Information Technology, and Tourism Statistics, Statistics Indonesia

Mr. Kemueli Naiqama, Deputy Government Statistician, Bureau of Statistics, Fiji

Mr. Kaushal Joshi, Principal Statistician, Asian Development Bank
The Roundtable of Chief Statisticians was held to discuss the significance of the efforts in developing an MST Framework. Clara van der Pol, UNWTO MST team leader, summarised the progress to date and work required to advance the development of the MST Framework. Her summary highlighted seven key stages and emphasised the essential ingredient of collaboration and engagement throughout.

### Stages towards a statistical framework for measuring sustainable tourism

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Engage, research, discuss</th>
<th>Pilot studies</th>
<th>Statistical standard</th>
<th>Capacity building</th>
<th>International database</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Policy and decision-making</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

With this context, the gathered statistical experts presented various viewpoints with key aspects to emerge being:

- The need to recognize that the 5 Ps – people, planet, peace, prosperity and partnership – must be considered and must be measured across the three pillars of economic, social and environmental impacts and integrated using a statistical framework;

- The importance of building on established frameworks and using existing experience to ensure coverage over multiple countries and cultures;
That recognition of sustainable tourism at the highest international level through UN resolutions is significant but that evidence is needed to support policy and track progress;

The potential to connect to the Cape Town Global Action Plan for Sustainable Development Data and more generally, the requirements for SDG reporting, recognizing the need for official statistics to demonstrate strategic leadership and co-ordination;

The wide range of possibilities for pilot studies at sub-national, national and global level implemented following the 4 As of Fiji – awareness (institutional, stakeholder), appreciation (at grassroots and at national level), administrative empowerment (development of consolidated database) and action (keep moving forward using results).

Africa is very much excited that we are now discussing the Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism. Africa spoke with one voice in supporting the UN Resolution backing this initiative. The strategy of having a common position in Africa, and of bringing together various stakeholders, has led to many successes in statistics. Having the platforms to interact, discuss and engage enables us to come up with common positions.

Mr. Zachary Mwangi Chege, Director General, National Bureau of Statistics, Kenya

The Roundtable clearly supported the aim of presenting an MST Framework to the UN Statistical Commission in 2020. In doing so, the aim is to secure the benefits of credibility in measurement, commonality in language and the foundations for improved coordination in data collection and compilation. More broadly, advancing MST and hence broadening tourism statistics beyond the economic sphere, would demonstrate the potential for statisticians to play an active and central role in sustainability discussions.
Session 1:
Understanding needs and putting data to use

Moderator:  Mr. Carlos Vogeler, Executive Director for Member Relations, UNWTO

Participants: Mr. Emad Hassan, Advisor to the Minister for Green and Sustainable Tourism, Ministry of Tourism, Egypt

Mr. Sérgio Guerreiro, Director, Knowledge Management & Corporate Affairs, Turismo de Portugal and Representing the European Travel Commission

Ms. Beatriz Marco Arce, Deputy Director for Tourism Intelligence, Spain Tourism Board (Turespaña), Spain

Ms. Jing Liu, Programme Officer, International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN)

Mr. Dirk Glaesser, Director, Sustainable Development of Tourism, UNWTO

Ms. Miriam Cecilia Adame Alcaraz, Director, Information and Analysis, Secretariat of Tourism of the State of Guanajuato, Mexico

Mr. Geoffrey Lipman, Professor, Victoria University, Australia and Hasselt University Limburg, Belgium
Sustainable tourism is increasingly relevant in national agendas for its role in fostering economic growth, social inclusiveness and the protection of cultural and natural assets. The seven experienced data users in this session understood this context and clearly described the need for information to support progress. They made clear that despite the long-standing interest and discussion of sustainable tourism, and the important advances in tourism statistics, no standardized approach exists for the collection and comparison of relevant information, at either the national or subnational level. This significant gap limits the potential for the development of policies directed at advancing sustainable tourism. Evidence to support policy and track progress is critical.

At the same time, it was recognized that the challenges facing the development of tourism policy to support sustainable outcomes are wide ranging. Many factors need to be incorporated and consolidated, usually in circumstances where responsibility for implementation is distributed across layers of government. Added to this is the need to address the perspectives of small businesses, large corporations, local communities and other stakeholders linked to the sector.

In this diverse context, there appears an immediate benefit for decision makers in providing all stakeholders with a single, comprehensive, trusted and agreed-upon picture of the status, trends and projections for tourism activity and its associated impacts and outcomes.

However, it is essential not to underestimate the challenges involved including integration of data across domains and scales and translating sustainable tourism information to be meaningful at the level of local communities and businesses. Indeed, the importance of information at local and destination levels was seen as critical and there was a need to ensure that internationally agreed statistical standards could still take into account the needs of local stakeholders. Generating easy-to-understand indicators could help all stakeholders see sustainability practices in their daily life.

Ultimately, the measurement of sustainable tourism cannot occur in isolation and ongoing engagement with all stakeholders will be essential in establishing and maintaining a data set that is relevant to user needs at all levels of interest.

In the field of conservation we have realized that we also need to bring positive messages to the floor. Beyond our Red List of Endangered Species that highlights the problems, we have now our Green List to recognize the fairly governed and effectively managed protected areas in the world. By recognizing, we promote sustainable management. We have to define a common language with different stakeholders whereby the actions of protection can be recognized. If we want people to protect nature, they need to experience it through visiting and tourism.

Ms. Jing Liu, Programme Officer, International Union for Conservation of Nature, IUCN
Session 2:
Linking the economic and environmental measurement of tourism

Central paper by
Mr. Carl Obst, UNWTO Consultant

Moderator: Mr. Karoly Kovacs, Chief, Statistics of International Trade in Services Section, UN Statistics Division (UNSD)

Participants: Ms. Demi Kotsovos, Senior Economist, Statistics Canada

Ms. Artika Devi, Senior Statistician, National Accounts & Satellite Accounts, Fiji Bureau of Statistics

Mr. Raúl Figueroa Díaz, Director of Satellite Accounts, Instituto Nacional de Estadística y Geografía (INEGI), Mexico

Mr. Faisal Al Saleemi, Information Department Manager, Tourism Information and Research Center, Saudi Arabia

Mr. Florande S. Polistico, Chief Statistical Specialist Initiatives, Philippine Statistics Authority
Tourism is not an isolated phenomenon in countries’ economies and societies. Life is getting more and more complicated. For statistics to be able to deal with this exponential complexity, we develop frameworks that are aligned with the mother of statistics: the System of National Accounts (SNA). This is what we are doing with MST. It is easy to say “go ahead and do it” but it is a lot of work to execute. Implementation in countries oftentimes struggles with budget limitations.

Mr. Karoly Kovacs, Chief, Statistics of International Trade in Services Section, UN Statistics Division

The starting foundation of the MST Framework is the bridging of the economic and environmental dimensions of sustainable tourism by linking two existing UN statistical standards: the Tourism Satellite Account: Recommended Methodological Framework (TSA:RMF) and the System of Environmental-Economic Accounting (SEEA). Moderated by Mr. Karoly Kovacs of UNSD, who supports UNWTO in the MST project, this session presented a draft of an overarching technical note and some pioneering pilot studies integrating economic and environmental data for tourism.

The Technical Note has been structured to provide a starting point for compilers of tourism and environmental-economic accounts to consider ways in which the accounting information can be adapted and extended to organize information for assessing sustainable tourism. At this stage, an initial set of four core accounts are described covering water and wastewater, energy, greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions, and solid waste.

The relevance and feasibility of work on linking these two areas of measurement was highlighted in a series of country presentations. Excellently presented examples from Canada, Fiji, Mexico, Saudi Arabia and the Philippines showed as well that development of the MST Framework is not limited to those countries with statistical systems that are considered to be more developed. Indeed, working directly on issues of policy relevance is possible in all countries.
Extension is required beyond environmental flows to account for tourism’s connection to environmental assets, ecosystems and biodiversity. This connection is needed to assess longer-term environmental sustainability, particularly at local scales. Accounting frameworks also provide stronger basis for deriving indicators across many SDGs.

Conceptual and data challenges are certainly evident but the key message emerging from all work on tourism and environmental accounts is that effective collaboration across disciplines, sectors and governmental agencies is fundamental to surmount them. Building the MST Framework with a spirit of engagement is therefore essential. Advancing the development of the MST Framework through the use of pilot studies is to be actively encouraged to ensure it is as relevant and feasible as possible.

In order to obtain the necessary data, inter-institutional arrangements are very important. We like to speak to data providers, like the managers of protected areas, not only in terms of the costs of the protected area but also of the benefits of a protected area. When they see that a protected area generates more benefits than costs, they have an important incentive to expand the number of protected areas and also to provide us with the data so that they can continue substantiating their work.

Mr. Raúl Figueroa Díaz, Director of Satellite Accounts, INEGI Mexico
Session 3:
Employment: a key aspect of the social dimension of sustainable tourism

Central paper by
Mr. Igor Chernyshev, International Labour Organization/UNWTO Consultant

Moderator: Mr. Rafael Diez de Medina, Chief Statistician and Director, Department of Statistics, International Labour Organization (ILO)

Participants: Mr. Ma yiliang, Head of Tourism Statistics, China National Tourism Administration (CNTA), Tourism Data Center and China Tourism Academy

Ms. Roxana Arguedas, Information Administration, Instituto Costarricense de Turismo, Costa Rica

Ms. Chen Xu, Cardiff Business School

Mr. Vincent Nijs, Research Project Manager, VisitFlanders, Belgium

Mr. Christophe Demunter, Tourism Statistics Section, European Commission (EUROSTAT)
The last International Conference on Tourism Statistics in Bali in 2009 moved the discussion from the physical dimension (arrivals and nights) of tourism and the statistical evaluation of its economic importance, to the analysis of tourism employment. This variable which is crucial not only because it reinforces the economic role of tourism, but also because it gives information on the “social impact” of the sector.

A key focus in this session was the proposal of measuring green jobs within tourism, i.e. those tourism jobs aimed at reducing negative environmental impacts. The presentation highlighted the potential to build on existing, but separate, discussion of green jobs and tourism jobs to establish appropriate definitions for measurement. In relation to labour and employment, other presentations highlighted the significance of the link to economic and social outcomes in China and Wales, and a presentation from EUROSTAT highlighted the potential to develop sub-national views connecting tourism activity and employment outcomes.

TSA can be further developed and adapted to bring useful intelligence to the sustainable economic development debate. Data requirements might be large, but not significantly more than for TSA itself – in our case the data largely existed already.

More broadly in the social dimension, the Conference heard of the Social Progress Index for Tourism Destinations that has been successfully applied in Costa Rica and of a new method for establishing the views of local residents towards tourism that was trialled in Flanders, Belgium.

Overall, the presentations highlighted the relevance and potential of looking at sub-national level data in order to investigate issues surrounding employment and social outcomes, especially for consideration at community level. A key message as well is that while a common perception is that measurement of the social dimension of sustainable tourism is far less advanced, avenues to advancement may be close at hand. Thus, it seems that integration at sub-national level of standard employment data and other social characteristics information – for example on income, gender, age, education and ethnicity – may provide an excellent starting point for analysing the social dimension of tourism in a more integrate fashion.

We have heard that sustainability is centered in people. And people means quality of their employment. We have heard about the need to have smiles on the faces of all people engaged in tourism. This will not happen if people’s rights are not respected or if there are bad industrial relations. Decent work also applies to sustainable tourism.

Mr. Rafael Diez de Medina, Chief Statistician and Director, Department of Statistics, ILO
Session 4: Subnational measurement in the Philippines and around the world

Session 4 – Part I: Subnational Measurement in the Philippines

Moderator: Ms. Maria Cherry Lyn S. Rodolfo, Consultant in Tourism and Aviation, The Asia Foundation, Philippines

Participants: Mr. Candido J. Astrologo, Assistant National Statistician, Philippine Statistics Authority

Ms. May Lacao, Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Ms. Maria Corazon M. Ebarvia, Project Manager, Partnerships in Environmental Management for the Seas of East Asia (PEMSEA), Quezon City, Philippines

Tourism is “seen and felt” at the destination level, with management taking place at this level. At the same time, broader policy direction and resource allocation is often made at the national level, and policy implementation can be the role of intermediate, regional authorities. There is also an overarching demand for global monitoring as reflected in the SDGs. The relevance of information at different spatial scales – destination, sub-national, national and global – is a strong rationale for harmonization between data at these levels to facilitate policy coherence and effectiveness.
A significant gap recognized in the development of the MST Framework is that sustainable tourism has been conceptualized and applied at the destination level while tourism statistics has focused on national level measurement. This session explored research and applications of the measurement of sustainable tourism at sub-national level.

Part I of the session focused on the Philippines. The presentations highlighted that:

- There was potential to use existing data from registers and other administrative sources and that data sharing among different government offices should be encouraged.

- A comprehensive understanding of ecosystem values can guide management decisions regarding trade-offs in any of the three dimensions – economic, socio-cultural and environment.

- Discussion of the blue economy should raise awareness of the natural capital inherent in marine and coastal environments which provides food and supports ecosystems, regulation of carbon sequestration and activities in culture and tourism.

In national level tourism statistics we use concepts like Gross Domestic Product and Gross Value Added but these values are in fact generated because we have resources. We have the seas, wildlife, and terrestrial assets that enable us to develop and promote tourism. But are they really accounted for in the Gross Value Added reported by hotels, by restaurants and by our countries? A lot more work can be done. The Philippines is pioneering much great work in this area.

Ms. Maria Cherry Lyn S. Rodolfo,
Consultant in Tourism and Aviation, The Asia Foundation, Philippines

Manila, Philippines, June 2017
Session 4 – Part II: Subnational Measurement in the World

Moderator:  **Mr. Peter Laimer**, Deputy Director, Directorate Spatial Statistics, Statistics Austria and Chair of the UNWTO Committee on Statistics and Tourism Satellite Account (TSA)

Participants: **Mr. Luo Zhibin**, Deputy Mayor of Zhangjiajie Municipal Government, China
  
  **Ms. Mélanie Gauche**, Project Manager, Monitoring and Statistics Directorate, Ministry for the Ecological and Solidary Transition, France
  
  **Ms. Nagore Espinosa**, Coordinator of International Network on Regional Economics, Mobility and Tourism (INRouTe) and CEO of in2destination
  
  **Mr. Raúl Hernández-Martín**, Head of the Chair of Tourism, University of La Laguna
  
  **Mr. Carlos Carré**, Consultant for Conservation International
  
  **Ms. Jingyan Liu**, Professor, Associate Dean of Sun Yat-sen Business School, Sun Yat-sen University
  
  **Mr. Carl Obst**, UNWTO Consultant
In part II of the session, cases from around the world highlighted the extensive discussion that is ongoing about the measurement of sustainable tourism at sub-national levels. The progress documented through the INRouTe initiative and reflected in the research from the Canary Islands, Spain and from the Zhangjiajie Municipal Government, China, shows clearly that interest in this area of work is long-standing and relevant. Other presentations highlighted different aspects of the sub-national measurement issue including measuring tourism intensity and environmental impacts in France, ecotourism in the San Martin region of Peru and the development of a web-based application for regional Tourism Satellite Accounts in China.

It is clear from all of the presentations that sub-national data is of great relevance to measuring sustainable tourism. It is equally clear that the approaches and efforts are, at this stage, highly fragmented. A key task in the development of the MST Framework is therefore to provide a suitable platform to support the exchange of ideas and examples, including by describing standard approaches to defining commonly agreed spatial areas for tourism measurement. This would support not only presentation of individual data sets but also the integration of data across economic, environmental and social dimensions.

The statistical community is now in a bit of a dilemma. We need to produce data that is accurate, that is timely, reliable, and at a destination level. And sustainability should also be measured. And on top of this we should also develop simple indicators so that everybody can understand them. This is a real challenge.

Mr. Peter Laimer, Deputy Director, Directorate Spatial Statistics, Statistics Austria and Chair of the UNWTO Committee on Statistics and TSA
Session 5:
Producing data on sustainable tourism

Central Paper by
- **Mr. Christophe Demunter**, Tourism Statistics Section, European Commission (EUROSTAT)

Moderators:
- **Mr. John Kester**, Director of Statistics, Trends and Policy, UNWTO

Participants:
- **Ms. Sarah Mathews**, Head of Destination Marketing APAC, TripAdvisor and PATA Chairperson
- **Mr. Rifa Rufiadi**, Deputy Director of Tourism Statistics, Statistics Indonesia (BPS)
- **Ms. Ana Moniche**, Regional Government of Andalusia and Network of European Regions for a Sustainable and Competitive Tourism (NECsTouR)
- **Ms. Inmaculada Gallego**, Regional Government of Andalusia and NECsTouR
- **Mr. Aki-Hito Sato**, Assistant Professor, Kyoto University
- **Ms. Rochelle Turner**, Research Director, World Travel & Tourism Council (WTTC)
The world today produces more data than ever before. Irrespective of who produces this data (national statistical institutes, Ministries, private sector businesses (e.g. telecommunication companies)) or by what means (from survey-based, administrative or innovative sources like big data) – a statistical framework supports the production of trustworthy data to answer the questions at hand. It does so by making most effective use of data that are already available, identifying data gaps, promoting coherence and consistency, and helping to focus and prioritize resources for data collection.

This session explored the potential to use various data sources, particularly big data, for the measurement of sustainable tourism. The key note presentation from Christophe Demunter (EUROSTAT) described the 7 Vs of volume, velocity, variety, veracity, validity, volatility and value. These factors should be considered in assessing the use of big data. Greatest gains in the short to medium term appear evident in using big data to complement existing statistics by providing opportunities for improved timeliness, increased granularity in space and time, and new analysis and indicators.

Other presentations considered a number of other dimensions of data production. These included:

- The potential to use data from social media related sources, such as TripAdvisor, to examine many aspects of the tourism experience;
- The opportunities to develop tourism statistics based on mobile positioning data as shown in Indonesia;
- The development of regional data sets in Europe through NECsTouR;
- The use of gridded spatial data to integrate multiple data layers; and
- The development of global indicator sets to track progress toward sustainable tourism at the corporate level as undertaken by WTTC.

The technological advances underpinning the rise of big data will not slow down and it is essential that statisticians find opportunities to access and utilise new data sources to improve and extend current tourism datasets. The MST Framework must support statisticians in this task and ensure that the Framework is not premised on the use of traditional data sources but rather is capable of using and integrating all possible sources to provide the richest picture possible.
Session 6:
Tourism indicators for monitoring the SDGs

Central Paper by

Mr. Peter Laimer, Deputy Director, Directorate Spatial Statistics, Statistics Austria and Chair of the UNWTO Committee on Statistics and TSA

Moderator:  Mr. Sven Kaummans, Head of Section, Environmental-Economic Accounts and Sustainable Development Indicators, Federal Statistical Office of Germany

Participants: Ms. Lisa Grace S. Bersales, National Statistician, Philippine Statistics Authority and co-Chair of the Inter-agency and Expert Group on SDG Indicators

Mr. Maxime Verstraete, Vice President of Sustainability, Hilton Worldwide and Official Partner of the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development, 2017

Mr. Rafael Diez de Medina, Chief Statistician, Director Department of Statistics, International Labour Organization (ILO)

Mr. Karoly Kovacs, Chief, Statistics of International Trade in Services Section, UNSD
The demand for high-quality indicators to monitor progress has been most recently underlined by the adoption of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and the recognized importance of establishing clear, comparable and measurable indicators of progress towards these goals. The central presentation from Peter Laimer of Statistics Austria examined the indicators that have already been proposed for measurement of SDG targets 8.9, 12.b and 14.7 and, more importantly, provided suggestions as to additional indicators that could be used to demonstrate the role that sustainable tourism is playing in advancing progress towards other SDG targets and goals.

The session also considered broader issues of co-ordination in the development and reporting on SDG indicators, across countries and international agencies, and highlighted the role of a statistical framework in supporting regular and comparable monitoring on SDGs. The discussion observed as well, the potential for indicators to be developed at national and sub-national level beyond the global reporting requirements of the SDG process and, in this broader context, noted the relevance of developing indicators that reflect the connection between sustainable tourism and the impacts of climate change.

While the statistical community has a particular role in defining the relevant indicators and collecting data, there are other stakeholders with an interest in SDG measurement and related assessments of sustainability, especially in the private sector. Mr. Maxime Verstraete (Hilton Worldwide) conveyed the relevance of sustainability measurement for his sector – for informing different stakeholders (investors, customers and employees), for developing new products and promoting brands, and for more strategic planning and investment, including through identifying potential cost savings (e.g. through more efficient use and management of resources and the identification of best practice).

The relevance of indicators in communicating progress towards sustainable tourism is clear at all levels. It remains incumbent on the new MST Framework to provide a strong, conceptual base for the derivation of relevant indicators and the organization of the necessary underlying data.
The World Tourism Organization (UNWTO), a United Nations specialized agency, is the leading international organization with the decisive and central role in promoting the development of responsible, sustainable and universally accessible tourism. It serves as a global forum for tourism policy issues and a practical source of tourism know-how. Its membership includes 156 countries, 6 territories, 2 permanent observers and over 500 Affiliate Members.