Mr. Peter Laimer
Directorate Spatial Statistics

19th Meeting of the UNWTO
Committee on Statistics
Item 3.4

Madrid, 26-27 February 2019

MST-subgroup on SDG

Report and monitoring SDG indicator 8.9.2 (employment)

We provide information

Overview

1. **Preliminaries**
2. **SDG indicators with direct link to tourism**
3. **Other indicators with link to tourism**
4. **Rationale for having indicators**
5. **MST Expert Group 24-25 October 2018**
6. **Measuring employment in tourism**
7. **SDG-indicator 8.9.2 – Tourism employment**
8. **Conclusions**

1

Preliminaries

- ➢ The **UNWTO Committee on Statistics**, in partnership with the **UN Statistics Division** and with the support of the **UN Statistical Commission**, is supporting the development of the "Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism" (**SF-MST**) within the MST initiative.

- ➢ In the **last Committee meeting** (27-28 February 2018) it has been decided to establish - among others - a sub-group to the Working Group of Experts on MST led by Statistics Austria on "Tourism Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) Indicators" which will mainly focus on the conceptualization and development of SDG indicators in coordination with the formal process of the Inter-agency and Expert Group on SDG (**IAEG-SDG**) which concern:

  - ▪ the **tourism relevant SDG-indicators** for which UNWTO is Custodian Agency, and

  - ▪ the proposal of an **additional indicator set** comprising 10-15 indicators.

SDG indicators with direct link to tourism (1)

- ➢ The **tourism relevant indicators**, for which **UNWTO** is foreseen as the **Custodian Agency** are:

  - ▪ **8.9.1**: Tourism direct GDP as a proportion of total GDP and in growth rate (Tier II),

  - ▪ **8.9.2**: Proportion of jobs in sustainable tourism industries out of total tourism jobs (Tier III), and

  - ▪ **12.b.1**: Number of sustainable tourism strategies or policies and implemented action plans with agreed monitoring and evaluation tools (Tier III).

- ➢ However, in order to implement **future reviews of the indicator framework**, the following processes are foreseen:

  - ▪ **annual minor refinements** (including specifying or correcting a unit of measurement, clarification of terms, editorial changes, etc.), and

  - ▪ **two comprehensive reviews** of the indicator framework, whose results will be submitted for consideration and decision by the Statistical Commission at its **2020** and **2025** sessions.

SDG indicators with direct link to tourism (2)

During the meeting of the IAEG-SDGs (9-12 April 2018 in Vienna) the **following indicators** were proposed by UNWTO:

➢ **Indicator for Target 8.9**: Progress towards sustainable tourism

  ▪ It is proposed to substitute 8.9.1 and 8.9.2 with a single indicator: "**Progress towards sustainable tourism**" with 3 sub-measures:
    ✓ Tourism Direct GDP: This is defined in an international statistical standard adopted by UNSC (Tourism Satellite Account: Recommended Methodological Framework 2008)
    ✓ Employment in the tourism industries: This is defined in an international statistical standard adopted by UNSC (International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008).
    ✓ Energy use by the tourism industries: This is defined within the "Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism" (SF-MST) under development and planned for discussion by the UNSC in 2020.

➢ **Indicator for Target 12.b**: Stage of implementation of the Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism

---

Other indicators with link to tourism

➢ The UNWTO Committee on Statistics and the TSA considers that tourism may be relevant in **many more goals and targets beyond** those that explicitly mention sustainable tourism.

➢ An **additional set of indicators** around a "tourism theme" could be developed to complement the above indicators in order to support global and national monitoring for the SDGs.

➢ Therefore, the proposed indicators **should not be limited to the three SDG targets** that explicitly mention tourism, but should include indicators to inform other Goals or Targets where tourism might be relevant.

➢ This is in line with UN discussions to have a "**core**" global set of indicators **applicable to all countries** (approximately 100-120 indicators), complemented by a larger "thematic" set from which indicators can be "added on" and reorganized to more closely track national development priorities or certain themes (like tourism).

Rationale for having tourism indicators

- ➢ **Relevant indicators** and measures can help to understand the **size of tourism**, its structure and its **interrelation with the ecological, social and economic environment**.
- ➢ They support to **manage tourism components** and their **relationship** to the **environment**.
- ➢ They permit **decision makers** (on local, regional, federal as well as national level) a broader view of the whole tourism system moving away from the traditional, one-sided economic approach.
- ➢ Building on **indicators beyond** those already considered for tourism within the scope of the 17 SDG goals (8.9, 12.b, 14.7), more and **additional work has to be done**: clarifying concepts, developing agreed measurement definitions, establishing measurement boundaries and limits, describing potential measurement techniques and supporting ongoing implementation and training.

MST Expert Group 24-25 October 2018

- ➢ During the most recent "**Working Group of Experts on Measuring the Sustainability of Tourism**" a set of indicators was presented which concern
  - ✓ economic indicators (19),
  - ✓ ecological indicators (11),
  - ✓ social indicators (9).
- ➢ It **turned out** that
  - ✓ particular interest is existing related to the potential for MST to highlight new insights and **indicators** concerning sustainability;
  - ✓ there is a **need to develop indicators** to support discussion and to provide a tangible point of connection for the MST approach;
  - ✓ there is a need to be aware of the **availability of data** and the **measurement challenges**.

Summing up: A **high level of interest** related to the **development of indicators** and an **agreed set of indicators** for **measuring the economic, ecological and social sustainability of tourism**, including testing of proposed indicators was recognized.

Measuring employment in tourism - challenges

Labour is a **factor of production** (besides capital and land)…

➢ … and as such, related to a **production process**, **not to a product**, and - even less so - to the consumption of a product by **certain category** of consumers (e.g. a visitor);

➢ … and can be associated with the **total output of an establishment**, but **cannot be assigned** to any particular output or **part of output** without the use of specific assumptions and modelling procedures.

Therefore:

1) **Employment associated with tourism consumption** can only be estimated via an explicit or an implicit **model** (i.e. via tourism ratios and/or demand based on TSA).

2) **Tourism employment** - meaning the employment strictly related to the goods and services acquired by visitors and produced either by tourism industries or other industries - **cannot be directly observed** (e.g. the differentiation of selling of tourism products to visitors and non-visitors).

Measuring employment in tourism – data sources

Household Sample surveys	Population census	Surveys of establishments	Administrative sources
Sample	Complete enumeration	Sample or full count	Entire population
Measurement unit: Household	Measurement unit: Individual	Measurement unit: Establishment	Measurement unit: Individual, establishment
Main objective: Data on economically active and inactive persons	Main objective: Complete information on population´s size and characteristics	Main objective: Collection of economic variables of establishments	Main objective: Admini-strative process
CAPI, CATI and WAPI	CAPI, CATI and register	Web-questionnaire, CAPI, CATI, paper-questionnaire	Mainly web- or paper questionnaire
Done on a quarterly, yearly or current basis	Mostly done every 10 years	Mostly done on a yearly basis (samples)	Done on a current basis

… serve as a basis for measuring tourism employment!

Measuring employment in tourism – TSA-Table 7 (1)

STATISTICS AUSTRIA
The Information Manager

- ➢ **Tourism Satellite Account recommends** the estimation of employment in 12 tourism industries, only (as presented in TSA-Standard-Table 7).
- ➢ **TSA-Table 7** is showing employment by the tourism industries, additionally towards the number of jobs, FTE, hours worked etc.
- ➢ For estimating **tourism employment**
  - ✓ **tourism ratios** - based on TSA-Table 6 - might be applied to TSA-Table 7 by tourism industries, and
  - ✓ the respective results are **summed up**.
- ➢ It has to be **considered**, that …
  - ✓ … measurement of employment is limited to employment in the **tourism industries** and additionally does **not consider indirect effects**;
  - ✓ … persons providing tourism-characteristic services of an establishment belonging to a **non-tourism characteristic industry** (e.g. establishment whose principal activity is "agriculture" according to KAU-concept) will not be included in "employment in the tourism industries";
  - ✓ … persons employed in an establishment belonging to a **tourism characteristic industry** who participate in the establishment's non-tourism-characteristic activities (e.g. in "information and communication") will be included in "employment in the tourism industries";
  - ✓ … **seasonality** is not shown by yearly average employment figures.

www.statistik.at   slide 11 | 26-27 February 2019

Measuring employment in tourism – TSA-Table 7 (2)

STATISTICS AUSTRIA
The Information Manager

Table 7
Employment in the tourism industries

| Tourism industries | Number of establishments | Number of jobs by status in employment (*) | | | | | |
| | | Employees | | | Self-employed | | |
		Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total
1. Accommodation for visitors							
1.a. Accommodation services for visitors other than 1.b							
1.b. Accommodation services associated with all types of vacation home ownership							
2. Food- and beverage-serving industry							
3. Railways passenger transport							
4. Road passenger transport							
5. Water passenger transport							
6. Air passenger transport							
7. Transport equipment rental							
8. Travel agencies and other reservation services industry							
9. Cultural industry							
10. Sports and recreational industry							
11. Retail trade of country-specific tourism characteristic goods							
12. Country specific tourism industries							
Total							

Table 7 (continued)
Employment in the tourism industries

| Tourism industries | Number of hours worked by status in employment (*) | | | | | | Number of full-time equivalent jobs by status in employment (*) | | | | | |
| | Employees | | | Self-employed | | | Employees | | | Self-employed | | |
	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total
1. Accommodation for visitors												
1.a. Accommodation services for visitors other than 1.b												
1.b. Accommodation services associated with all types of vacation home ownership												
2. Food- and beverage-serving industry												
3. Railways passenger transport												
4. Road passenger transport												
5. Water passenger transport												
6. Air passenger transport												
7. Transport equipment rental												
8. Travel agencies and other reservation services industry												
9. Cultural industry												
10. Sports and recreational industry												
11. Retail trade of country-specific tourism characteristic goods												
12. Country specific tourism industries												
Total												

(*) In the reference period.

www.statistik.at   slide 12 | 26-27 February 2019

SDG-indicator 8.9.2 – tourism employment (1)

- ➢ The **employment relevant indicator**, for which **UNWTO** is foreseen as the **Custodian Agency** is:
  - ✓ **8.9.2**: Proportion of jobs in sustainable tourism industries out of total tourism jobs;
    - ▪ **Tier III**: No internationally established methodology or standards are yet available for the indicator, but methodology/standards are being (or will be) developed or tested.
- ➢ Related to employment the following indicator was proposed by UNWTO:
  - ✓ **Employment in the tourism industries**: This is defined in an international statistical standard adopted by UNSC (International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008).
    - ▪ **Tier II**: Indicator is conceptually clear, has an internationally established methodology and standards are available, but data are not regularly produced by countries.

SDG-indicator 8.9.2 – tourism employment (2)

Considering **employment**, the following data are available within UNWTO-compendium (mostly for reference years 2013-2017):

- ➢ Total number of **full-time equivalent jobs by status in employment:**
  - ✓ employees - male
  - ✓ employees - female
  - ✓ self-employed - male
  - ✓ self-employed - female
- ➢ Total number of **employees by tourism industries:**
  - ✓ in accommodation services for visitors (hotels and similar establish-ments)
  - ✓ in other accommodation services
  - ✓ in food and beverage serving activities
  - ✓ in passenger transportation
  - ✓ in travel agencies and other reservation services activities
  - ✓ in other tourism industries
- ➢ Total **number of jobs** by **status in employment**:
  - ✓ employees
  - ✓ self-employed

SDG-indicator 8.9.2 – tourism employment (3)

Final objective of discussion:

➢ **Proposal for an employment-indicators being submitted to UNSD!**

➢ **Proposal for a strategy in regard to missing employment data and countries!**

Issues to be discussed:

➢ Which **kind of employment data** might be relevant in general:
  - ✓ "Full-time equivalents", being in line with National Account statistics and high relevant in the tourism industry with a significant amount of part-time work?
  - ✓ Number of employees, by status of employment?

➢ Which **employment data** might be used for submission to UNSD:
  - ✓ ...those with high relevance: FTE?
  - ✓ ...those with the "best" country coverage: Total employees?

➢ How to deal with the missing countries:
  - ✓ ...doing best estimates, based on existing data sources (ILO)?
  - ✓ ...using additional/other data sources (ILO), business statistics (according to ISIC classification)?

➢ What about the data collection system:
  - ✓ ...by web-questionnaire?

MST-subgroup on SDG

Please address queries to:
Mr. Peter Laimer

Contact information:
Guglgasse 13, 1110 Vienna
phone: +43 (1) 71128-7849
fax: +43 (1) 4934300
peter.laimer@statistik.gv.at

Report and monitoring SDG indicator 8.9.2 (employment)