MST-subgroup on SDG

Report and monitoring SDG indicator 8.9.2 (employment)

Overview

1. Preliminaries
2. SDG indicators with direct link to tourism
3. Other indicators with link to tourism
4. Rationale for having indicators
5. MST Expert Group 24-25 October 2018
6. Measuring employment in tourism
7. SDG-indicator 8.9.2 – Tourism employment
8. Conclusions
Preliminaries

- The UNWTO Committee on Statistics, in partnership with the UN Statistics Division and with the support of the UN Statistical Commission, is supporting the development of the “Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism” (SF-MST) within the MST initiative.

- In the last Committee meeting (27-28 February 2018) it has been decided to establish - among others - a sub-group to the Working Group of Experts on MST led by Statistics Austria on “Tourism Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) Indicators” which will mainly focus on the conceptualization and development of SDG indicators in coordination with the formal process of the Inter-agency and Expert Group on SDG (IAEG-SDG) which concern:
  - the tourism relevant SDG-indicators for which UNWTO is Custodian Agency, and
  - the proposal of an additional indicator set comprising 10-15 indicators.

SDG indicators with direct link to tourism (1)

- The tourism relevant indicators, for which UNWTO is foreseen as the Custodian Agency are:
  - **8.9.1**: Tourism direct GDP as a proportion of total GDP and in growth rate (Tier II),
  - **8.9.2**: Proportion of jobs in sustainable tourism industries out of total tourism jobs (Tier III), and
  - **12.b.1**: Number of sustainable tourism strategies or policies and implemented action plans with agreed monitoring and evaluation tools (Tier III).

- However, in order to implement future reviews of the indicator framework, the following processes are foreseen:
  - annual minor refinements (including specifying or correcting a unit of measurement, clarification of terms, editorial changes, etc.), and
  - two comprehensive reviews of the indicator framework, whose results will be submitted for consideration and decision by the Statistical Commission at its 2020 and 2025 sessions.
SDG indicators with direct link to tourism (2)

During the meeting of the IAEG-SDGs (9-12 April 2018 in Vienna) the following indicators were proposed by UNWTO:

- **Indicator for Target 8.9:** Progress towards sustainable tourism
  - It is proposed to substitute 8.9.1 and 8.9.2 with a single indicator: "Progress towards sustainable tourism" with 3 sub-measures:
    - **Tourism Direct GDP:** This is defined in an international statistical standard adopted by UNSC (Tourism Satellite Account: Recommended Methodological Framework 2008)
    - **Employment in the tourism industries:** This is defined in an international statistical standard adopted by UNSC (International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008).
    - **Energy use by the tourism industries:** This is defined within the "Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism" (SF-MST) under development and planned for discussion by the UNSC in 2020.

- **Indicator for Target 12.b:** Stage of implementation of the Statistical Framework for Measuring Sustainable Tourism

Other indicators with link to tourism

- The UNWTO Committee on Statistics and the TSA considers that tourism may be relevant in many more goals and targets beyond those that explicitly mention sustainable tourism.
- An additional set of indicators around a “tourism theme” could be developed to complement the above indicators in order to support global and national monitoring for the SDGs.
- Therefore, the proposed indicators should not be limited to the three SDG targets that explicitly mention tourism, but should include indicators to inform other Goals or Targets where tourism might be relevant.
- This is in line with UN discussions to have a “core” global set of indicators applicable to all countries (approximately 100-120 indicators), complemented by a larger “thematic” set from which indicators can be “added on” and reorganized to more closely track national development priorities or certain themes (like tourism).
Rationale for having tourism indicators

- Relevant indicators and measures can help to understand the size of tourism, its structure and its interrelation with the ecological, social and economic environment.
- They support to manage tourism components and their relationship to the environment.
- They permit decision makers (on local, regional, federal as well as national level) a broader view of the whole tourism system moving away from the traditional, one-sided economic approach.
- Building on indicators beyond those already considered for tourism within the scope of the 17 SDG goals (8.9, 12.b, 14.7), more and additional work has to be done: clarifying concepts, developing agreed measurement definitions, establishing measurement boundaries and limits, describing potential measurement techniques and supporting ongoing implementation and training.

MST Expert Group 24-25 October 2018

- During the most recent “Working Group of Experts on Measuring the Sustainability of Tourism” a set of indicators was presented which concern
  - economic indicators (19),
  - ecological indicators (11),
  - social indicators (9).
- It turned out that
  - particular interest is existing related to the potential for MST to highlight new insights and indicators concerning sustainability;
  - there is a need to develop indicators to support discussion and to provide a tangible point of connection for the MST approach;
  - there is a need to be aware of the availability of data and the measurement challenges.

Summing up: A high level of interest related to the development of indicators and an agreed set of indicators for measuring the economic, ecological and social sustainability of tourism, including testing of proposed indicators was recognized.
Measuring employment in tourism - challenges

Labour is a factor of production (besides capital and land)... 

- ... and as such, related to a production process, not to a product, and - even less so - to the consumption of a product by certain category of consumers (e.g. a visitor);
- ... and can be associated with the total output of an establishment, but cannot be assigned to any particular output or part of output without the use of specific assumptions and modelling procedures.

Therefore:

1) Employment associated with tourism consumption can only be estimated via an explicit or an implicit model (i.e. via tourism ratios and/or demand based on TSA).

2) Tourism employment - meaning the employment strictly related to the goods and services acquired by visitors and produced either by tourism industries or other industries - cannot be directly observed (e.g. the differentiation of selling of tourism products to visitors and non-visitors).

Measuring employment in tourism – data sources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Household Sample surveys</th>
<th>Population census</th>
<th>Surveys of establishments</th>
<th>Administrative sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Main objective: Data on economically active and inactive persons</td>
<td>Main objective: Complete information on population’s size and characteristics</td>
<td>Main objective: Collection of economic variables of establishments</td>
<td>Main objective: Administrative process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAPI, CATI and WAPI</td>
<td>CAPI, CATI and register</td>
<td>Web-questionnaire, CAPI, CATI, paper-questionnaire</td>
<td>Mainly web- or paper questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Done on a quarterly, yearly or current basis</td>
<td>Mostly done every 10 years</td>
<td>Mostly done on a yearly basis (samples)</td>
<td>Done on a current basis</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

... serve as a basis for measuring tourism employment!
Tourism Satellite Account recommends the estimation of employment in 12 tourism industries, only (as presented in TSA-Standard-Table 7).

TSA-Table 7 is showing employment by the tourism industries, additionally towards the number of jobs, FTE, hours worked etc.

For estimating tourism employment
- tourism ratios - based on TSA-Table 6 - might be applied to TSA-Table 7 by tourism industries, and
- the respective results are summed up.

It has to be considered, that ...
- ... measurement of employment is limited to employment in the tourism industries and additionally does not consider indirect effects;
- ... persons providing tourism-characteristic services of an establishment belonging to a non-tourism characteristic industry (e.g. establishment whose principal activity is “agriculture” according to KAU-concept) will not be included in “employment in the tourism industries”;
- ... persons employed in an establishment belonging to a tourism characteristic industry who participate in the establishment’s non-tourism-characteristic activities (e.g. in “information and communication”) will be included in “employment in the tourism industries”;
- ... seasonality is not shown by yearly average employment figures.

Measuring employment in tourism – TSA-Table 7 (1)

Table 7 Employment in the tourism industries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tourism industry</th>
<th>Number of establishments</th>
<th>Number of full-time employees</th>
<th>Number of part-time employees</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Number of FTE employees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accommodation</td>
<td>1,000,000</td>
<td>100,000</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>150,000</td>
<td>150,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food service</td>
<td>2,000,000</td>
<td>200,000</td>
<td>100,000</td>
<td>300,000</td>
<td>300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tour operators</td>
<td>3,000,000</td>
<td>300,000</td>
<td>150,000</td>
<td>450,000</td>
<td>450,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Measuring employment in tourism – TSA-Table 7 (2)

Table 7 Continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tourism industry</th>
<th>Number of establishments</th>
<th>Number of full-time employees</th>
<th>Number of part-time employees</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Number of FTE employees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accommodation</td>
<td>1,000,000</td>
<td>100,000</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>150,000</td>
<td>150,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food service</td>
<td>2,000,000</td>
<td>200,000</td>
<td>100,000</td>
<td>300,000</td>
<td>300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tour operators</td>
<td>3,000,000</td>
<td>300,000</td>
<td>150,000</td>
<td>450,000</td>
<td>450,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The employment relevant indicator, for which UNWTO is foreseen as the Custodian Agency is:

- **8.9.2**: Proportion of jobs in sustainable tourism industries out of total tourism jobs;
  - **Tier III**: No internationally established methodology or standards are yet available for the indicator, but methodology/standards are being (or will be) developed or tested.

Related to employment the following indicator was proposed by UNWTO:

- **Employment in the tourism industries**: This is defined in an international statistical standard adopted by UNSC (International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008).
  - **Tier II**: Indicator is conceptually clear, has an internationally established methodology and standards are available, but data are not regularly produced by countries.

Considering employment, the following data are available within [UNWTO-compendium](http://www.statistik.at) (mostly for reference years 2013-2017):

- **Total number of full-time equivalent jobs by status in employment**:
  - employees - male
  - employees - female
  - self-employed - male
  - self-employed - female

- **Total number of employees by tourism industries**:
  - in accommodation services for visitors (hotels and similar establishments)
  - in other accommodation services
  - in food and beverage serving activities
  - in passenger transportation
  - in travel agencies and other reservation services activities
  - in other tourism industries

- **Total number of jobs by status in employment**:
  - employees
  - self-employed
SDG-indicator 8.9.2 – tourism employment (3)

Final objective of discussion:
- Proposal for an employment-indicators being submitted to UNSD!
- Proposal for a strategy in regard to missing employment data and countries!

Issues to be discussed:
- Which kind of employment data might be relevant in general:
  - “Full-time equivalents”, being in line with National Account statistics and high relevant in the tourism industry with a significant amount of part-time work?
  - Number of employees, by status of employment?
- Which employment data might be used for submission to UNSD:
  - ...those with high relevance: FTE?
  - ...those with the “best” country coverage: Total employees?
- How to deal with the missing countries:
  - ...doing best estimates, based on existing data sources (ILO)?
  - ...using additional/other data sources (ILO), business statistics (according to ISIC classification)?
- What about the data collection system:
  - ...by web-questionnaire?

Please address queries to:
Mr. Peter Laimer

Contact information:
Guglgasse 13, 1110 Vienna
phone: +43 (1) 71128-7849
fax: +43 (1) 4934300
peter.laimer@statistik.gv.at

MST-subgroup on SDG

Report and monitoring SDG indicator 8.9.2 (employment)